

Modelling eutrophication in lake ecosystems: A review

Brigitte Vinçon-Leite, Céline Casenave

▶ To cite this version:

Brigitte Vinçon-Leite, Céline Casenave. Modelling eutrophication in lake ecosystems: A review. Science of the Total Environment, 2019, 651 (Part: 2), pp.2985-3001. 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.09.320 . hal-02070268

HAL Id: hal-02070268 https://enpc.hal.science/hal-02070268

Submitted on 10 Jun 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial - NoDerivatives 4.0 International License

*Revised manuscript with no changes marked (double-spaced and continuously LINE and PAGE numbered) Click here to view linked References

1	Modelling eutrophication in lake ecosystems: a review
2	Brigitte Vinçon-Leite, Céline Casenave
3	
4	Abstract
5	Eutrophication is one of the main causes of the degradation of lake ecosystems. Its intensification during the
6	last decades has led the stakeholders to seek for water management and restoration solutions, including those
7	based on modelling approaches. This paper presents a review of lake eutrophication modelling, on the basis
8	of a scientific appraisal performed by researchers for the French ministries of Environment and Agriculture.
9	After a brief introduction presenting the scientific context, a bibliography analysis is presented. Then the
10	main results obtained with process-based models are summarized. A synthesis of the scientist recommenda-
11	tions in order to improve the lake eutrophication modelling is finally given before the conclusion.
12	
13	1 Introduction
14	Eutrophication of aquatic ecosystems refers to an ecological state, where biological processes driven by in-
15	creased nutrient loading from their watershed conducts to proliferation of primary producers (phytoplankton,
16	aquatic plants, cyanobacteria), hypoxia or even anoxia and loss of biodiversity. Worldwide, eutrophication is
17	one of the main causes of the degradation of the ecological state in inland and coastal waters. Eutrophication
18	has been observed since the beginning of the twentieth century in industrialized countries (e.g. Le Moal et
19	al., 2018; Moss, 2012; Takolander et al., 2017; Yao et al., 2018). However, during the last decade, eutrophi-
20	cation has become a more pregnant societal issue, encompassing many different stakes, from ecological to
21	economic and political, which must be tackled at the scale of the concerned territories by the involved stake-
22	holders.
23	Lakes and reservoirs are part of the hydrological cycle of their watershed. Fluxes are permanently exchanged
24	between the lake and the atmosphere, the ground and surface waters. Lakes play an essential role in the bio-
25	geochemical cycles of continental watersheds. Two processes drive these biogeochemical cycles, particularly
26	Carbon, Nitrogen and Phosphorus cycles: the primary production and the settling of particulate matter.

In lakes, the current velocities are generally low and the water residence time high. Therefore, lakes provide
us with a time-integrated response to the external forcing. The analysis of their time trajectory can allow us
to better understand the biological and physical, local and global pressures that they face (Perga et al., 2016;
Schindler, 2009).

31 Lake ecosystems are particularly sensitive to nutrient loading from their catchment because of the thermal 32 stratification of the water column during the period when the primary production is maximal (spring and 33 summer). The thermal stratification divides the water column into two layers: the upper layer, the warmer 34 and lighted epilimnion, where primary production occurs, and a colder deeper layer, the hypolimnion. Ther-35 mal stratification occurs in all lakes but extending on different time scales. In shallow lakes, thermal stratifi-36 cation hardly lasts more than a few hours or days. The main morphometric (depth, volume) and hydrological 37 (discharge of the tributaries, surface and land-use in the catchment) characteristics will determine the lake 38 vulnerability to eutrophication.

In the early 1960s, lakes were the first water bodies where eutrophication effects were observed, mainly on the water resources used for drinking water supply (*e.g.* Dillon and Rigler, 1974a; Vollenweider and Kerekes, 1982). Actually, lake eutrophication started in industrialized countries since the 1930s as it is indicated by recent outcomes based on paleo-limnological studies. This is the case in Europe, for example for Lake Bourget (France) where eutrophication appeared around 1933 (Giguet-Covex et al., 2010; Jenny et al., 2013).

In the 1960-1980s, lake eutrophication was widely described, in particular in symposia devoted to this topic like the Madison Symposium (National Academy of Sciences, 1969) or the Symposium of the American Society of Limnology and Oceanography (ASLO) in 1971. Historically, the description of lake eutrophication was more directed to deep lakes, located in the Northern hemisphere (United States, Canada, and Western Europe) and Australia. The general acceptation of lake trophic state classification, "oligotrophic", "mesotrophic" and "eutrophic" follows the studies of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) in the late 1970s (Vollenweider, 1975; Vollenweider and Kerekes, 1982).

The main effects of lake eutrophication are an increase of phytoplankton biomass, where cyanobacteria frequently dominate, a decrease of water transparency and a clear difference between surface layers, rich in oxygen, and the deoxygenated hypolimnion (Dodds, 2006; Wetzel, 2001). Hypoxia in the hypolimnion leads to an internal phosphorus load released by the sediment, which in turn amplifies the eutrophication of the
system (Dodds, 2006).

57 Eutrophication has been one of the main threats for water quality in lakes and reservoirs since the 1960s. In 58 spite of number of research works conducted during the last five decades, eutrophication remains a major 59 concern worldwide (Smith et al., 2006). More than 40% of lakes are eutrophic and affected by algal blooms 60 (Bartram et al., 1999). The issues to be addressed still regard interactions between nutrients, principally 61 phosphorus which is generally the main cause of lake eutrophication, and the ecological functioning. New 62 manifestations of eutrophication have emerged during the last two decades (Anderson et al., 2012; Le Moal 63 et al., 2018; Pomati et al., 2017). Among the phytoplankton species, cyanobacteria have gained an increased 64 interest, due to the worldwide occurrence of their blooms. The increasing frequency of cyanobacteria blooms might be linked to climate change. 65

66 The management and restoration solutions to control eutrophication must be supported by scientific outcomes, including modelling approaches. Since the 1970s and the awareness of the negative impact of eutro-67 phication on lake ecosystems, numerical modelling was considered as an interesting tool (Imboden, 1974; 68 Vollenweider, 1975; Vollenweider and Kerekes, 1982). Many models were developed, often to obtain pre-69 70 dictive tools used as support for lake management and to define targets of nutrient loading reduction by the 71 catchment. The model key state variables are those that link primary production to nutrients, principally 72 phosphorus, nitrogen and sometimes silica (De Senerpont Domis et al., 2014; Reynolds et al., 2001). 73 Cyanobacteria growth also raises new modelling issues to represent processes such as nitrogen fixation, up-74 take of nutrient organic forms and mobility of the cells.

75 In order to support public decision-making, issues raised by public entities, for example a ministry, can be 76 addressed in the form of a multidisciplinary critical assessment of available scientific knowledge, called col-77 lective scientific expertise. In 2016, two French ministries respectively in charge of ecology and agriculture, 78 initiated a collective scientific expertise (Expertise Scientifique Collective, ESCo in French), bringing to-79 gether scientific knowledge available on the eutrophication issue (Pinay et al., 2017). The objective was to 80 improve the consistency and effectiveness of public action on eutrophication control. One chapter of the 81 scientific expertise report was devoted to eutrophication modelling (Crave et al., 2017). This chapter in-82 cluded five sections respectively entitled "Modelling of non-point nutrient loading in the catchment", "Modelling in-stream processes", "A focus on sediment transport modelling", "Modelling eutrophication in coastal
ecosystems" and "Modelling eutrophication in lake ecosystems". A review of marine eutrophication models
derived from this scientific expertise study can be found in (Ménesguen and Lacroix, 2018). The paper presented hereafter is based on the chapter focusing on lake eutrophication modelling and including a large review of modelling studies.

88 The bibliographic corpus that we considered is composed of 438 references obtained by using the biblio-89 graphic search tool proposed by Web of Science (see Appendix 6.1 for details). The paper is organized as 90 follows. In section 2, the bibliographic corpus is analysed according to the following items: study sites, ob-91 jectives, model typology and main research topics. Additional statistics about the number of publications and 92 citations; the general categories, research areas and journal titles; and the keywords of the references includ-93 ed in the bibliographic corpus are given in Appendix 6. Section 3 is dedicated to the modelling results ob-94 tained with process-based models. Finally we summarize the scientist recommendations in order to improve the lake eutrophication modelling in section 4, and we raise some key issues for future achievements in this 95 96 research field in the conclusion section.

97

98 2 Bibliography analysis

99 2.1 Study sites

Several lakes have been considered as case studies for the application of eutrophication models. An automatic search routine was implemented to search for the names of lakes in the title, abstract and keywords of the references of the bibliographic corpus. It led to a list of 118 lake names and 230 references. The repartition of the references according to the continent, the country and the name of the lakes is given in Table 1. The evolution over the time of the number of publications according to the continent of the studied lake is given in Figure 1.

Table 1. Number of publications depending on the continent, the country and the name of the studied lake. Only the countries
and the lakes that have been found in three or more than three publications are listed.

- 108
- 109

Figure 1. Time evolution of the number of publications according to the continent of the studied lake.

111 The most studied lakes are located in North America (mostly in the USA and Canada) and Asia (in China, Japan, Turkey and Russia). Lakes of Western Europe (in The Netherlands, Estonia, Switzerland and Ger-112 113 many) and Northern Europe (in Finland and the United Kingdom) also receive special attention. The Great 114 lakes or Laurentian lakes (Lakes Erie, Ontario, Michigan, Superior and Huron) located between the USA and 115 Canada are the subject of numerous publications. Apart from them, we can mention the particular case of 116 Lake Taihu (China) that is intensively studied (26 papers), as much as for Lake Erie but at a different pace. 117 Publications on Lake Erie started in 1984 and on Lake Taihu in 2004. Among the other lakes, there are many large lakes with a surface area over 100 km², as it is the case of Lake Dianchi (China), Kinneret (Israel), 118 119 Balaton (Hungary), Chaohu (China), Okeechobee (USA), Peipsi (Finland) and Kasumigaura (Japan).

120 Regarding the time evolution, the lakes that were studied during the 1970s and the 1980s are mainly located 121 in North America (Ditoro et al., 1987; Snodgrass, 1987, 1985). In the 1990s, modelling works were then carried out on lakes from Western Europe (Asaeda and Van Bon, 1997; Hollander et al., 1993). And since 122 2000, there has been a significant increase in modelling studies conducted on Chinese lakes, particularly 123 124 since 2010 (Hou et al., 2004; Huang et al., 2012; W. Li et al., 2014). In parallel, lake ecosystems from South America (Fragoso et al., 2008), Southern Europe (Alonso Fernandez et al., 2014), Middle East such as 125 126 Karaoun reservoir in Lebanon (Fadel et al., 2017) but mainly Lake Kinneret in Israel (Bruce et al., 2006; Gal 127 et al., 2009) and Africa (Asaeda et al., 2001) were also modelled.

Finally, models have also been applied to high-altitude or high-latitude lakes in recent years (Patynen et al., 2014; Romshoo and Muslim, 2011). Similarly, the preservation of ecological continuity in the urban and peri-urban environment and the promotion of Nature-based solutions for the urban water management led to recent modelling works of small urban lakes (*e.g.* Gong et al., 2016; Soulignac et al., 2017).

132

133 **2.2 Modelling objectives**

Several purposes have led to the development of lake eutrophication models. Although eutrophication models are not only used for management purposes but also for research (Simonsen and Dahl-Madsen, 1978; Vanhuet, 1992), we will focus in this paper mainly on the management objectives. In the keyword analysis, the words "management", "simulation", "prediction" and "restoration" appear respectively, in 54, 49, 31 and 138 22 references of the bibliographic corpus, which represents 12%, 11%, 7% and 5% of the references. This139 shows how lake eutrophication is a concerning problem for which practical solutions are needed.

In the 1970s, the OECD model (Vollenweider, 1975), that has been calibrated on a data set coming from more than 200 lakes of several continents, was used to predict the eutrophication response to phosphorus loading. The nutrient load limits in the USA and Canada have been established from this model.

Some models have been used to assess the conditions for achieving regulatory or management objectives. For example, the 1D vertical model DYRESM-CAEDYM was used to compute the level of phosphorus input reduction necessary to make the ecological status of Lake Ravn (Denmark) comply with the requirements of the European Water Framework Directive (Trolle et al., 2008).

147 Models are also developed to perform numerical experiments. Recently, the sharp increase in the number of 148 reservoirs worldwide (World Commission on Dams, 2000), for irrigation, drinking water production and 149 hydroelectricity, has led researchers to investigate the effects of eutrophication on the carbon and greenhouse gas cycle in these water bodies (Chanudet et al., 2012; Stepanenko et al., 2016). Models are also used to 150 predict the functioning and the impact of a reservoir that is expected to be built (Inkala et al., 1998). Con-151 versely, some papers focus on the simulation of the impact of climate changes on lake eutrophication (Elliott 152 153 and Defew, 2012; Hassan et al., 1998; Schwefel et al., 2016). It includes the increase of temperature (Mark-154 ensten et al., 2010) and the intensification of extreme climatic events such as floods (Brito et al., 2017) or 155 storms (Schwalb et al., 2015).

Model of lake eutrophication are also often used to predict the evolution of variables of interest. In the short 156 157 term (one or two weeks), the objective can be to predict algal blooms, particularly cyanobacteria blooms. It makes it possible to anticipate the measures to be taken depending on the water body use: recreational activi-158 159 ties such as bathing, production of drinking water, etc. (Huang et al., 2015, 2012; W. Li et al., 2014; Recknagel et al., 2016). Over longer time-scales, models are used to predict the response of lake ecosystems to cli-160 161 mate change scenarios or local changes in nutrient input (Chapra and Canale, 1991; Pipp and Rott, 1995), 162 sometimes with a special focus on cyanobacteria dynamics (Howard and Easthope, 2002; Markensten et al., 163 2010; Varis, 1993).

Finally, models are also developed to test some control strategies for the restoration of lakes (*e.g.* Sagehashi et al., 2001). The reduction of nutrient loads is the most studied strategy (e.g Lindim et al., 2015; Ozkundakci et al., 2011). Some papers focus on biomanipulation which consists in adding or removing species from the ecosystem (Jayaweera and Asaeda, 1996; Ogilvie and Mitchell, 1995; Sagehashi et al., 2001). Other alternative lake restoration techniques are studied, such as sediment dredging (Sagehashi et al., 2001), water diversion (Liu et al., 2014), addition of macrophytes (Xu et al., 2014, 1999) or hypolimnetic oxygenation (Moore et al., 1996; Sahoo and Luketina, 2003; Singleton et al., 2010; Toffolon and Serafini, 2013).

171

172 2.3 Model typology

The scientific community early recognized the value of mathematical modelling for the study of lake ecosystems. Researchers have developed numerous models of various types. Recent reviews of lake modelling developments can be found in (Bhagowati and Ahamad, 2018a; Jørgensen, 2010b). Depending on how the ecosystem is represented mathematically, we can distinguish several classes of models (see for example (Jørgensen and Fath, 2001; Mooij et al., 2010a)). Thus, models are generally first separated in two classes: empirical models and mechanistic models (Fornarelli et al., 2013).

179 2.3.1 Empirical models

180 Empirical models, also called data-oriented models (Afshar et al., 2012) or data-driven models (Elshorbagy 181 and Ormsbee, 2006) are derived from the available data sets. They mainly consist in statistical relationships 182 (called transfer functions) between predictor variables and response variables of interest. The first empirical 183 models that were developed were regression models that assume linear relationships between the variables as 184 it is the case for the nutrient-chlorophyll relationships given in (Dillon and Rigler, 1974a; Reckhow, 1993). Empirical models present several advantages: they require little a priori knowledge about the ecosystem 185 processes and the data themselves; few data and "simple mathematics are needed" and these models are ge-186 neric and "give good predictions for a group of lakes" (Vanhuet, 1992). However, when applied to an indi-187 vidual lake, empirical models often lead to large uncertainties. According to Vanhuet (1992), "empirical 188 189 models are often applied if only mean annually values are of interest". However, due to the rapid progress in 190 available computational power, and to the increasing use of high frequency measurement systems based on

191 in situ sensors, interest in empirical models is still growing. These models are used for different purposes, for 192 example to re-analyze statistical relationships between nutrients and chlorophyll in different contexts (Brown 193 et al., 2000; Huszar et al., 2006). New statistical approaches are also proposed to improve the quality of the models. For example, quantile regression is applied instead of ordinary least square regression in (Xu et al., 194 195 2015) and a Bayesian approach is used to link nutrient and chlorophyll concentrations in (Freeman et al., 196 2009). Bayesian model averaging has also been proposed to predict the occurrence of harmful algal blooms 197 (Hamilton et al., 2009). However, these models provide results associated with a very large level of uncer-198 tainty and over time scales too long to study the short-term response to a decrease in nutrient inputs by the 199 watershed; they therefore lack precision for use by managers (Reynolds and Elliott, 2010).

200 Statistical models of the 1970s and 1980s have evolved significantly over the last decade towards "data-201 driven" models. Such models need large datasets that were not available in the past, but that lake monitoring systems are now able to collect. Artificial neural networks (ANNs) are now commonly used to study lake 202 eutrophication (Chen and Liu, 2014; Ieong et al., 2015; Millie et al., 2006; Rankovic et al., 2010), because of 203 204 "their recognized capability in predicting highly nonlinear and complex relationships" (Fornarelli et al., 2013). However, if ANNs provide interesting prediction tools, their construction is a "highly demanding 205 task, particularly when dealing with short and noisy ecological data" (Chaves and Kojiri, 2007; Fornarelli et 206 207 al., 2013; Kim et al., 2012). Other data-driven models using machine learning techniques such as tree-based 208 models (Fornarelli et al., 2013; Jung et al., 2010; Peretyatko et al., 2012), support vector machines (Diaz 209 Muniz et al., 2015; Garcia-Nieto et al., 2018; Yunfeng Xu et al., 2015) or random forests (Hallstan et al., 210 2012) are also proposed. For short-term (day to weeks) forecast, such data-driven models give good results, 211 but for the simulation of long-term prospective scenarios, they hardly can be used as it is necessary to in-212 clude knowledge about the driving processes.

213 2.3.2 Mechanistic models

Mechanistic models, also called process-oriented models (Arhonditsis and Brett, 2004), process-based models (Fornarelli et al., 2013) or theoretical models (Vanhuet, 1992), are based on the *a priori* knowledge of the driving processes of the ecosystem. Most of them consist in a set of differential or difference equations which describe in details the biogeochemical processes and whose solution is obtained by numerical methods. Several review papers focusing on mechanistic models have been published (*e.g.* Anagnostou et al.,
2017; Arhonditsis and Brett, 2004).

220 In the 1980s, mechanistic models often compute the steady-state concentration of variables, leading to 221 nonlinear static relationships between variables of interest (e.g. Imboden, 1974; Schnoor and O'Connor, 222 1980; Vollenweider, 1975). These models are called "input-output" models (Vollenweider, 1975) or black-223 box models (Teruggi and Vendegna, 1986) and are sometimes considered as empirical models whereas their 224 structure is directly deduced from dynamic equations of biogeochemical processes. The data that generally 225 come from a group of lakes, are only used to identify the model parameters with statistical methods. This 226 approach has been widely used to estimate the trophic state of numerous lakes (e.g. Jones and Bachmann, 227 1976; Dillon and Rigler, 1974b). As they are based on a steady-state assumption, input-output models fail to "predict the dynamic trend of eutrophication in a large reservoir with temporal variation in inflow and stor-228 age" (Afshar et al., 2012). Moreover, these models "do not describe the biological variables which are of 229 230 main interest" and "do not take into account the influence of biological processes on the model parameters" 231 and some "important interactions between several phytoplankton limiting factors, light, phosphorus, nitro-232 gen" (Simonsen and Dahl-Madsen, 1978).

233 Most mechanistic models are dynamic. Mooij et al. (2010) make the distinction between "minimal dynamic models", "complex dynamic models" and "structurally dynamic model". Minimal dynamic models are sim-234 235 ple and composed of only a few differential or differences equations; they "often generate a hypothesis about 236 a possible cause of a phenomenon that would not easily be arrived at intuitively" (Mooij et al., 2010a). On 237 the contrary, complex dynamic models (e.g. CAEDYM, PCLake, DELWAQ) include numerous variables 238 and processes and are designed to be used as a virtual reality for the simulation of the whole ecosystem. 239 They are therefore often coupled with a detailed hydrodynamic model and validated on field data. A com-240 parison between nine complex dynamic models commonly used to study eutrophication can be found in 241 (Anagnostou et al., 2017). Structurally dynamic models have then been proposed to add flexibility in the 242 structure of the models (Jørgensen, 2015). The idea is to make the model parameters vary over time, based 243 on the expert knowledge or by optimization of a well-chosen goal function. Kalman filter (Huang et al., 244 2013) is based on similar idea: by addition of a "correction" term in the equations of the model, it enables to 245 adjust the model variables to the measurements. Finally, we can mention the particular case of the BLOOM

246 model (Los, 1980) which also relies on optimization techniques: it is based on the computation of the opti-247 mal species composition via linear programming.

In the above-mentioned models, the ecosystem is described at the population level. The need to take into account some specific features of the populations, such as size distribution or other traits, led the researchers to use the individual-based approach (DeAngelis and Mooij, 2005). As it is « too computationally demanding to model all individuals separately » (Mooij et al., 2010a), derived approaches that are computationally more efficient, have been proposed, such as super-individual models, physiologically structured population models, stage-structures biomass models, and trait-based models. Mention should be made of other approaches such as energy system language (*e.g.* Rivera et al., 2007).

255 Mechanistic models have been applied to many lakes (e.g. Cui et al., 2016; Hou et al., 2004; Takkouk and Casamitjana, 2016), and their contribution to the study of the spatio-temporal dynamics of ecosystems is 256 257 widely recognized. In particular, hydrodynamic processes are represented accurately. However with regard to biological processes, because of the complexity of the process interplay, and the lack of knowledge, 258 mechanistic models still need to be improved. Mechanistic models are already complex and involve a large 259 set of parameters (sometimes more than 100) to be calibrated. As a consequence, the outcomes of simulated 260 261 scenarios are hampered with great uncertainty (Gal et al., 2014). The calibration itself is a difficult task be-262 cause it necessitates the use of extensive data sets (Elshorbagy and Ormsbee, 2006) and because the simula-263 tions, particularly when coupled with 3D hydrodynamic models, are computationally demanding. Limita-264 tions concerning their application at the decision-making level have been emphasized (Fornarelli et al., 2013). Nevertheless, deterministic models remain best suited to simulate the spatio-temporal response of lake 265 266 ecosystems to forcing change scenarios. Moreover the increase of the computational power should facilitate the use of such models in the future. 267

Note that mechanistic models are often deterministic but the stochastic nature of the events and pathways leading to eutrophication should encourage the use of stochastic components (Kutas and Toth, 1985; Sarkar and Chattopadhayay, 2003; Wang and Qi, 2018).

271

272 2.3.3 From box models to 3D models

To reproduce accurately the ecosystem dynamics, mechanistic models are frequently coupled with a hydrodynamic model that can be quite simple, simulating only the water temperature and the regime of temperature stratification and mixing or more complex, simulating also the current velocities and patterns.

276 The spatial dimension of the coupled models varies from zero (box models): in that case "the water body of a 277 lake or of each box within a lake is represented as a completely mixed stirred tank reactor" (Nyholm, 1978), 278 to three : the spatial heterogeneity of the ecosystem is taken into account in all three dimensions. If a box 279 model alone cannot account for the lake spatial heterogeneity, this can be obtained using a set of interconnected box models (Muraoka and Fukushima, 1986; Nyholm, 1978). For example, Smiths lake has been 280 281 divided into 11 boxes, each of them is represented as a well-mixed reactor, connected to its neighbouring 282 boxes through fluxes (Everett et al., 2007). For the vertical dimension, some models simulate the thermal stratification by using 2-box models with one box for the epilimnion and one box for the hypolimnion (Frisk, 283 284 1982; Imboden, 1974; Imboden and Gächter, 1978; Rodriguez Reartes et al., 2016).

Vertical 1D models are also frequently used to simulate the thermal stratification and its influence on phytoplankton, nutrient and oxygen dynamics (Bell et al., 2006; Fennel et al., 2007; Trolle et al., 2008). 2D models, more rarely used, are developed for large but shallow systems where thermal stratification is negligible (Fragoso et al., 2008; Huang et al., 2012; Zhang et al., 2008). 3D models appeared in the early 2000s (Kuo and Thomann, 1983), but it was in the 2010s, due to the increase of computational power and of *in situ* measurements, that 3D models have been increasingly applied on lakes (Carraro et al., 2012; Deus et al., 2013; Leon et al., 2011; Schwalb et al., 2015; Soulignac et al., 2017).

The coupling of models can be a difficult task. The Framework for Aquatic Biogeochemical Models (FABM) has been developed to facilitate the coupling between several hydrodynamic models and ecological models (Trolle et al., 2011a).

295 **2.4 Main research topics studied with lake models**

As shown by the keywords analysis (see appendix 6.4), the models can represent different components of the ecosystem. In the following section, we will analyse more in details how these components are represented: (1) phytoplankton; (2) nutrients; (3) sediments; (4) oxygen; (5) cyanobacteria.

299 2.4.1 Phytoplankton

A significant number of references of the bibliographic corpus (115 references, 26% of the total) are marked with the keyword "phytoplankton" which shows the importance given to the modelling of phytoplankton dynamics (Elliott and Thackeray, 2004; Frisk et al., 1999; Hillmer et al., 2008; Reynolds and Irish, 1997; Rukhovets et al., 2003; Seip, 1991).

304 In many models, in particular empirical models but also water quality models, only the total phytoplankton 305 biomass is represented. In recent years, the study of changes in phytoplankton community composition has 306 received special attention, leading to the development of phytoplankton succession models (Rigosi et al., 307 2010). The phytoplankton community is divided into different groups, either by modelling all the species 308 individually or by incorporating community information into the models (Hallstan et al., 2012). The phyto-309 plankton modelling relies on a representation of the functional characteristics of species (Hallstan et al., 310 2012; Jones and Elliott, 2007; Kerimoglu et al., 2017a; Mieleitner and Reichert, 2008, 2006). In a few cases, 311 models seek to represent the functioning of individuals in a phytoplankton population during the different 312 stages of their life cycle through the use of "agent-based" or "individual based models" (Hellweger et al., 313 2008). These models can be used to predict either short-term changes in phytoplankton community composition (Huang et al., 2014, 2012), or medium to long term changes (Elliott et al., 2005; Markensten et al., 314 315 2010). 3D models allow for better consideration of spatial heterogeneities in phytoplankton development (Hillmer et al., 2008; Leon et al., 2012, 2011). 316

Some studies focus on the modelling of particular processes, such as: (1) the influence of physical functioning on phytoplankton dynamics (Bernhardt et al., 2008; Elliott et al., 2009; Elliott and Defew, 2012; Gulliver and Stephan, 1982; Jones and Elliott, 2007; Na and Park, 2006; Patynen et al., 2014; Verhagen, 1994); (2) the relationships between external or internal nutrient inputs and phytoplankton dynamics (Burger et al., 2008; Cui et al., 2016; Li et al., 2015); (3) the interactions between phytoplankton and macrophytes (Asaeda et al., 2001).

323 **2.4.2** Nutrients

Within the bibliographic corpus, numerous references, precisely 117 references (17%), 46 references (11%) and 74 references (17%), are marked respectively with the keywords "phosphorus", "nitrogen" and "nutrient" (see section **Error! Reference source not found.**). These references do not necessary focus on the modelling of nutrients only. Phosphorus is the most studied nutrient as it is generally considered as the main 328 limiting nutrient of phytoplankton growth in most lakes (*e.g.* Schindler, 2006; Sondergaard and Jeppesen,
329 2007).

As for phytoplankton, some models – mostly the empirical and static ones – only represent the total phosphorus (Dillon and Rigler, 1974b, 1974a; Nürnberg and LaZerte, 2004; Seo and Canale, 1996) and/or the total nitrogen concentrations (Brown et al., 2000; Ji et al., 2014; Milstead et al., 2013; Reckhow, 1993).

However, to describe correctly the nutrient cycle and its dynamics, the different nutrient forms are often dis-333 334 tinguished. The phosphorus is generally divided into two groups: particulate and dissolved phosphorus (Lung et al., 1976). Other models make the distinction between organic and inorganic nutrients (Deus et al., 2013). 335 336 Among the dissolved inorganic nitrogen pool, nitrate and nitrite are often separated from the ammonium (Lindim et al., 2015; Wu et al., 2017), the nitrification and denitrification processes being considered as es-337 sential for the ecosystem dynamics. In complex models such as CAEDYM (Hipsey et al., 2011), in addition 338 339 to the forms previously mentioned (particulate/dissolved, organic/inorganic, nitrate/nitrite/ammonium), the 340 organic compartments can also be divided into labile and refractory forms.

Finally the carbon, nitrogen and phosphorus contents of biological organisms such as zooplankton, phytoplankton, bacteria or macrophytes can be described, through the use of either constant or variable stoichiometric ratios (see CAEDYM model (Hipsey et al., 2011)). Fernandez et al. (1997) introduced as model variables the soluble reactive, the soluble non-reactive and the particulate phosphorus cell quotas in phytoplankton, which are defined as phosphorus amount per biomass unit (Droop, 1968). The phosphorus content in shoots, secondary shoots and roots of macrophytes can also be included (Asaeda et al., 2000).

347 In order to simulate accurately the nutrient concentration dynamics in lakes, interactions between nutrients 348 and other components of the ecosystem are often represented (Asaeda et al., 2001). Nutrient outputs through 349 evaporation, denitrification and rivers or ground outflows can be included, as it is the case of nutrient external inputs coming from the watershed, the atmospheric deposition, the rainfall, and the ground. Some papers 350 351 deal specifically with nutrients external loadings that are computed from watershed models such as SPAR-352 ROW (Benoy et al., 2016; Milstead et al., 2013; Robertson and Saad, 2011), from specific models such as PCLoad (van Puijenbroek et al., 2004) or from satellite images (Politi and Prairie, 2018). In (Liu, 2013), an 353 354 empirical model is introduced to estimate the nutrient release from industrial manufacturing, livestock breed-355 ing, crop agriculture, household consumption and atmospheric deposition. Nutrient internal loading is increasingly considered in the models (Burger et al., 2008; Li et al., 2015) as its impact on the lake nutrient concentrations and the phytoplankton growth limitation is now recognized (Wu et al., 2017). To simulate the internal cycling it can be necessary to take into account some bio-physical processes such as nutrient upwelling fluxes (Hamblin et al., 2003), sediment resuspension (Chung et al., 2009) and nutrient release from sediments (Riverson et al., 2013).

361 2.4.3 Sediment

About 10% of the references (46 references out of 438) have "sediment" as keyword. Sediment is an impor-362 tant pool of nutrients that play a key role in the nutrient cycles. Most of the models that specifically focus on 363 sediment are 0D models, namely box-models (Chapra and Canale, 1991) or 1D vertical models (Chung et al., 364 2009; Gudimov et al., 2016). The main processes considered in these models are: (1) sediment diagenesis 365 which refers to the set of biogeochemical processes within the sediment (Gudimov et al., 2016; Paraska et 366 367 al., 2014); (2) sediment resuspension (Chung et al., 2009); (3) and nutrient and/or oxygen exchanges between the sediment and the water column (Smits and van der Molen, 1993; Snodgrass, 1987; Walker and 368 369 Snodgrass, 1986).

370 2.4.4 Oxygen

The word "oxygen" appears in 46 of the 438 selected references, which represents 10% of the bibliographic 371 372 corpus. Most of oxygen models are mechanistic (Antonopoulos and Gianniou, 2003; Bell et al., 2006; Bonnet and Poulin, 2004; Chapra and Canale, 1991), but some empirical models have also been developed (Chen 373 374 and Liu, 2014; Elshaarawi, 1984; Rankovic et al., 2010). Oxygen dynamics is generally modelled by includ-375 ing one variable, the oxygen concentration, and several related processes. Depending on the other variables of the model, reaeration, aerobic respiration of living organisms, photosynthesis of plants, oxidation of the 376 organic matter and denitrification can be included (Stansbury et al., 2008; Xu and Xu, 2016). Sometimes, 377 sediment oxygen demand (SOD) is also represented (Antonopoulos and Gianniou, 2003; Deus et al., 2013; 378 379 Terry et al., 2017), to account for the quantity of oxygen uptake by sediment when it is not explicitly repre-380 sented. In general, oxygen models are coupled with sediment models (Gudimov et al., 2016; Moore et al., 1996). 381

382 2.4.5 Cyanobacteria

383 The keyword "cyanobacteria" has been found in 35 references of the bibliographic corpus, which corre-384 sponds to 8% of the selected references.

According to many authors (e.g. Carey et al., 2012; Gkelis et al., 2014; Newcombe et al., 2012; O'Neil et al., 385 386 2012), eutrophication and climate change promote algal blooms and more specifically cyanobacterial 387 blooms. Since the 1990s, cyanobacteria has been the subject of modelling works related to eutrophication (Easthope and Howard, 1999; Patterson et al., 1994), but the number of articles devoted to this subject has 388 particularly increased since the mid-2000s. On the 5th of July 2018, the databases available on the Web of 389 Science that we queried with the search equation "TITLE=((lake model*) AND (cyanobacter* OR 390 391 bloom*))" gave a list of 71 references, more than 85% of which were written after 2005. The models of cyanobacteria range from simple regression models (Onderka, 2007) to 3D coupled hydrodynamic-392 393 ecological models (Carraro et al., 2012). Models that are dedicated to the prediction can be mechanistic but are mainly empirical (Carvalho et al., 2011; Cha et al., 2014) and increasingly based on "data-driven" ap-394 proaches (Obenour et al., 2014; Zhang et al., 2015). 395

Cyanobacteria, which are procaryotic phytoplankton, can be represented either with the same variable as phytoplankton (Shan et al., 2014) - in that case it is assumed to be dominant throughout the year – or as a sub-group of phytoplankton. In CAEDYM model (Hipsey et al., 2011) for example, phytoplankton can be decomposed into five groups: dinoflagellates, cyanobacteria, chlorophytes, cryptophytes and diatoms. Cyanobacteria can also appear under the name of "blue-green algae" as a sub-group of phytoplankton (*e.g.* Harada et al., 2013). Some specific processes of cyanobacteria are sometimes represented, as for example its flotation capacity in the water column (Aparicio Medrano et al., 2013; Walsby, 2005).

403 **2.5 Model selection**

The previous paragraphs give an overview of the different types of models that are used for the modelling of lake eutrophication. We can then wonder how to choose among these different types of models. Answering to this question is not simple, but general trends can nevertheless help our choice. The selection of the model type and structure will depend on the available knowledge and data, and on the modelling objective. With little knowledge about the ecosystem, only empirical models can be considered. Regression models can be obtained from few data and are useful to estimate mean annual values. On the other hand, data-driven models based on machine learning techniques require a large amount of data and manage to make short-term predic411 tion. On the opposite, process-based models will be considered only if sufficient knowledge about the processes of the ecosystem is available. Data are nevertheless also required for such models, especially for the 412 413 calibration of the model parameters. However, the results of process-based models can also be used for qualitative studies. In that case, the model outputs are validated by confrontation with the already acquired 414 415 knowledge. Finally, when both knowledge and data are available, we can consider mixed approaches. For 416 example, we can use a Kalman filter technique that requires data to adjust the parameters of a process-based 417 model. Concerning the structure of the model, the variables to be represented are the variables of interest for 418 the study, namely the variables that we want to simulate and the variables on which they depend. In the same 419 way, we will represent the processes of interest and the ones that we assume to have an impact on the system 420 we intend to represent. The time-scale of the targeted simulations will also determine the processes to be included.For example, it may be useless to take into account daily variations of some processes if we are 421 422 interested on the annual variations of the ecosystem. Finally, depending on the level of ecological description 423 (individuals, species, populations, etc.), different types of models can be considered: individual based-424 models, population equations, meta-ecosystems.

425 3 Main results obtained with process-based models

426 In the sequel, we only review the results obtained with process-based models because this type of models is 427 required when models are to be used in prospective scenarios. Indeed, for assessing ecosystem evolution, at 428 long or mid-term, in response to local and global changes (e.g. climate change, urbanization, ...) or restora-429 tion actions, it is mandatory in our opinion that the main processes involved in the ecosystem functioning are 430 taken into account.

431 Many eutrophication models of lake ecosystems have been applied to study sites for which monitoring data 432 are available. Model description, including represented processes and equations, as well as calibration and 433 validation results are presented in many articles (e.g. Bruce et al., 2006; Elliott and Thackeray, 2004; Elliott et al., 2007; Hamilton and Schladow, 1997; Leon et al., 2011; Lewis et al., 2002; Los and Brinkman, 1988; 434 Reynolds et al., 2001, 2001; Riley and Stefan, 1988, 1988; Rukhovets et al., 2003). These models are mainly 435 applied to simulate phytoplankton biomass, nutrients, oxygen, and in some cases cyanobacteria. The results 436 of these models are given in the sequel. 437

439 **3.1 Phytoplankton dynamics**

Aimed at better understanding phytoplankton dynamics, process-based models are run at seasonal to multiannual time scales. The main issues addressed are as follows: biomass of the main phytoplankton groups and/or of total phytoplankton, total chlorophyll concentration, values at different depths or mean values in the epilimnion, phenology of phytoplankton blooms (biomass peak dates, duration of threshold overpass), etc.

Phytoplankton data are generally biovolumes of species identified by microscopy. Because of the long time necessary to obtain this type of data, the measurements are frequently performed in mean samples, for example collected in the euphotic layer or at a specific depth (Bruce et al., 2006; Elliott et al., 2007). Chlorophyll is frequently considered as a proxy of phytoplankton biomass. For example, the results of multiannual simulations over 11 years in Lake Erken (Sweden) are expressed as monthly mean total chlorophyll in the surface layer (0-10m) (Elliott et al., 2007).

In large lakes, 3D modelling can be required. Hillmer et al. (2008) compare the results of 1D vertical (DYRESM-CAEDYM) and 3D (ELCOM-CAEDYM) models on the same study site, Lake Kinneret. Taking into account the horizontal heterogeneity of the lake makes it possible to obtain better results. In Lake Erie (Leon et al., 2011) mesoscale physical processes such as upwelling and general circulation in the lake have been modelled with the 3D ELCOM model. The spatio-temporal evolution of the variables is well simulated even if the authors underline the difficulty of comparing the simulation results of the phytoplankton succession with the measurements because of the necessary aggregation of the species in the model.

Concentrations of chlorophyll or carbon are derived from field measurements of biovolumes, by using conversion factors, which vary widely between authors. The quality of the phytoplankton biomass results, when evaluated in relation to the total chlorophyll concentration, is generally considered satisfactory. To judge the acceptability of the results, one criterion frequently used, is that the model results remain within a range of two standard deviations from the mean of the measured values (Elliott et al., 2007).

Functional traits have been introduced in the definition of phytoplankton groups in order to better model the functional characteristics of an ecosystem and its responses to changes in nutrient inputs (Mieleitner and Reichert, 2008). This should also make the model more generic and allow better portability to other study sites. Nevertheless the predictive capacity of these models remains modest. The ability of 124 models to replicate the dynamics of functional phytoplankton groups has been studied recently (Shimoda and Arhonditsis, 2016). The authors note a very large variability in the characterization of the functional phytoplankton groups as well as in the mathematical formulations that describe the main physiological processes of these groups (growth, nutrient absorption kinetics, mobility, etc.).

471

472 **3.2 Cyanobacteria dynamics**

Cyanobacteria strongly impair lake ecological functioning. Moreover they cause significant public health 473 474 problems. Modelling their dynamics and the processes that control them are therefore the subject of many 475 studies (Belov and Giles, 1997; Carraro et al., 2012; Elliott, 2012; Guven and Howard, 2006; Hense and 476 Beckmann, 2006). According to many authors (e.g. Carey et al., 2012; Gkelis and Zaoutsos, 2014; Newcombe, 2012; O'Neil et al., 2012; Paerl and Huisman, 2008; Paerl and Paul, 2012), the ongoing climate 477 change is likely to result in an increase in global cyanobacterial biomass as well as in occurrences of blooms. 478 Guven and Howard (2006) provide a review and critical analysis of 12 main models of cyanobacteria devel-479 480 opment in lake ecosystems. Two modelling approaches are discussed: deterministic models and neural network models. These models generally focus on describing either the biological processes involved in the 481 482 growth of biomass or the processes involved in the motion of cells. Few people combine all the aspects that 483 affect the dynamics of cyanobacteria.

Migration in the water column is a characteristic process of cyanobacteria: the rate of settling or flotation in the water column varies according to their density, which itself varies according to the amount of carbohydrates and volume of vacuoles in the cells. This is a very complex, non-linear process, with many feedbacks. It involves the intensity of photosynthesis, which is itself a function of the intensity of light in the water column, and therefore of the location of cyanobacteria in the water column. In addition, the different species of cyanobacteria form colonies whose morphometric characteristics affect the mobility. The models depict the migration process with different levels of complexity.

In Kromkamp and Walsby (1990), the density change depends on two simultaneous processes: an increase controlled by the light intensity received by the cells and a decrease as a function of time. The parameter

493 values of the equations were obtained from experimental data of density change of a cyanobacterium species 494 (*Planktothrix aghardii*) as a function of time and light intensity. The results show that the size of the colonies 495 influences the migration rate but not the depth reached in the water column. The biomass vertical location 496 fluctuates according to the rise of the floating colonies and the settling of others towards the bottom. Phos-497 phorus deficient cells migrate to greater depths than light-limited cells.

Howard et al. (1996) propose a cyanobacterial growth and transport model that accounts for, on the one hand, the photosynthesis production, the cell density variation and the vertical migration of cells and on the other hand, the turbulent mixing in the water column that also affects cyanobacteria motion.

501 Belov and Giles (1997) present a dynamic model of cyanobacteria motion based on the properties of regula-502 tion of cell buoyancy under simplified conditions: an isothermal water column where nutrients are not limit-503 ing factors. The main factor controlling cell mobility is the nycthemeral cycle of light. The article focuses on 504 analysing under these conditions the mathematical behaviour of the equations involved in the model.

505 One of the specificities of cyanobacteria is the ability of certain species, the diazotrophic species, to fix at-506 mospheric nitrogen. Accounting for this process allows the models to better represent the control of the succession of species by the available nutrients. Hense and Beckmann (2010) propose several versions of a 507 model of the life cycle of diazotrophic cyanobacteria, considering the active phase of nitrogen fixation and 508 the vegetative phase of cells. The ecological characteristics, life cycle of cyanobacteria and interactions with 509 510 hydrodynamics are particularly complex (Figure 2). The simplified approach satisfactorily describes the dy-511 namics of cyanobacteria, in particular the time patterns of blooms and the intensity of nitrogen fixation. The 512 proposed set of equations can be inserted into different types of lake models of cyanobacterial dynamics.

513

514

Figure 2. General sketch of main steps of cyanobacteria life cycle (Hense, 2010).

515

516 In Lake Pusiano, Carraro et al. (2012) validated the 3D model ELCOM coupled to the CAEDYM biological 517 model with high frequency measurements to identify the factors, including hydrodynamic factors, which 518 drive the spatial distribution of the cyanobacterium *P. rubescens*. Regarding the impact of climate change on cyanobacteria, Elliott (2012) reviewed different predictive models. Most of the analysed results show an increase in the relative biomass of cyanobacteria due to an increase in water temperature, an increase in residence time and an increase in nutrient loading from the watershed. The main effect of climate change is to alter the phenology of cyanobacterial blooms and the abundance of their biomass. The lake food web is also changing due to the low nutritional value of cyanobacteria for zooplankton.

525

526 **3.3** Integration of models in early warning system

527 For management applications, models are often integrated into warning systems to predict short-term phyto-528 plankton blooms, particularly to improve operational control of cyanobacterial blooms (Shimoda and Arhon-529 ditsis, 2016). Most articles describe the models used and the architecture of the system. But few *a posteriori* 530 comparisons of the forecasts with measurements made afterwards, are performed.

In order to predict algal blooms in Lake Taihu, the EcoTaihu model has been integrated into a Windows software platform (Zhang et al., 2013). The results of the simulations generally show a good agreement with the measurements. But the authors also point out that no model is able to integrate all ecological processes. The forecast discrepancies are not only due to the model but also to data uncertainties and because modelling results and field measurements are not directly comparable.

536

537 **3.4** Ecosystem response to local management strategies

Eutrophication models can be used to study prospective scenarios and compare the impact of local manage-538 ment alternatives. Several management scenarios of Los Molinos reservoir (Argentina) were tested with a 539 model describing the dynamics of nutrients and phytoplankton (Rodriguez Reartes et al., 2016). After cali-540 541 bration and validation of the model, scenario simulation results highlighted the impact on water quality of 542 livestock husbandry practices and of insufficient wastewater treatment, especially septic tanks. According to 543 the model simulations, the combination of wastewater treatment in the reservoir direct watershed and measures to reduce nutrient loading (N and P) from livestock would be the most beneficial to preserve the quality 544 545 of the lake.

The effects of different actions to reduce eutrophication of a lake in Sweden (reduction of nutrient inputs, biomanipulation, herbicide application) were analysed with a vertical 1D biogeochemical model (Pers, 2005). According to the simulation results, the best effects are obtained with a nutrient reduction and biomanipulation of the fish species.

550 The comparison of different prospective scenarios should include a reference scenario. This is not the case in 551 most of the performed modelling studies. This is due to the lack of sufficiently long-term historical data sets. 552 Moreover, it is particularly complex to achieve a reliable assessment of the environmental conditions prior to the onset of eutrophication. For total phosphorus, reference values of the watershed loading can be estimated 553 554 by different approaches (export coefficients, morpho-edaphic indices, paleolimnological estimates). But the 555 results of these different methods have rarely been compared. A study performed on 35 sub-alpine lakes in northern Italy (Salerno et al., 2014) highlighted the need of deterministic watershed models to estimate the 556 557 total reference phosphorus inputs.

An expected outcome of the prospective simulations regards the level of nutrient loading by the watershed that must not be overpassed to avoid eutrophication of a lake. But even when the targets to be achieved are derived from modelling results, the authors remind that these values must be considered with caution as the models are not able to anticipate accurately the changes in the trophic web that would occur in response to nutrient reduction (*e.g.* Trolle et al., 2008).

563 Modelling studies mainly focus on the advantages of the modelling approach developed and its transferabil-564 ity to other systems. The model is generally implemented on a particular study site for which a sufficient data set exists. Despite the transferability of process-based models, they must be implemented in a configuration 565 adapted to the characteristics of each lake in order to estimate the required threshold of nutrient loading 566 (Trolle et al., 2008). Moreover, due to the complexity of the ecological functioning of lake ecosystems, many 567 568 processes are not taken into account or are very simplified in the models (role of sediment, change of phyto-569 plankton assemblages, mobility of certain species, etc.). When recommendations are made, the authors are 570 very cautious and they immediately nuanced the recommendations. Thus, the total phosphorus loading which 571 would allow Lake Ravn (Denmark) to achieve the objectives of good ecological status required by the European Framework Directive on Water, was estimated thanks to a vertical 1D model (Trolle et al., 2008). The 572 573 authors recommend a reduction of at least 50% of the total phosphorus inputs by the watershed. In parallel,

574 they raise awareness on the possible cascade effects within the food web, not simulated by the model, and 575 which could lead to an unpredictable evolution of the ecosystem.

576

577 **3.5** Ecosystem response to global changes

A common application of models is the study of expected effect of global changes, especially climate 578 579 change. Climate change will impact precipitation patterns, wind speeds, solar radiation, and air temperature (e.g. Arnell and Gosling, 2013; Beniston et al., 2007; European Environment Agency, 2012). Most models 580 simulate the effect of climate change on different aspects of lake functioning related to eutrophication: 581 mainly oxygen concentrations (Fang and Stefan, 1997, 2009), phytoplankton growth (Hassan et al., 1998) 582 583 and the dominance of cyanobacteria (e.g. Elliott, 2012). The consideration of climate change is mainly based on two approaches: (1) the use of outputs from regional climate models treated by downscaling techniques to 584 585 obtain meteorological forcing at the studied lake level; or (2) a meteorological forcing sensitivity analysis 586 where actual measured meteorological data are modified by a range of factors.

Very often the analysis of the influence of climate change, in particular of global warming, focuses on cyanobacteria. Global warming is supposed to have a positive effect on the increase of cyanobacteria biomass (*e.g.* Carey et al., 2012; Newcombe, 2012; Paerl and Paul, 2012; Posch et al., 2012; Wagner and Adrian, 2009). Nevertheless, very few reliable predictive simulations of the dominance of cyanobacteria have still been performed (Elliott, 2012).

In Lake Windermere (Great Britain), the effect of an increase in water temperature and phosphorus loading on phytoplankton has been studied with the PROTECH model (Elliott, 2011). The results show an earlier spring peak of diatoms (2-3 days/°C). The biomass of diatoms, which is controlled mainly by light is little changed. On the other hand, the biomass of cyanobacteria increases with the increase of the two factors studied. These two factors act in synergy, the predominant influence being due to phosphorus inputs. The dominance of cyanobacteria is enhanced in late summer. Temperature impacts mainly succession and seasonal phytoplankton community whereas nutrient inputs affect the amount of produced biomass.

Howard and Easthope (2002) used the predictions of the HADCM2 climate model over a period of 90 years,
until the end of the 21st century, to simulate the evolution of the growth of the cyanobacterium *Microcystis*

in Farmoor Lake (Great Britain). The main meteorological variables used are the monthly averages of wind speed, cloud cover and solar radiation. The results do not show an overall increase in the annual biomass of cyanobacteria. On the other hand, the growth period of cyanobacteria would be longer with higher biomass than currently in spring (May) and autumn (September). These results only quantify the direct effect of climate change because the long-term change in rainfall on loading from the watershed is not taken into account.

The effect of global warming predicted until the end of the 21st century has been studied in three lakes in 607 New Zealand (Trolle et al., 2011b). A regional climate model based on the IPCC A2 scenario predicts an 608 609 average annual increase in air temperature of about 2.5 $^{\circ}$ C in the 2100s in the studied lake region. The future 610 climate conditions are described in a very simplified way; only the change of air temperature is taken into 611 account. The average annual increase in air temperature forecast for the year 2100 has been added to the average daily temperatures over the period 2002-2007. The morphometric and trophic characteristics of the 612 three modelled lakes are different. The first is quite deep (33.5m) and oligo-mesotrophic, the second shallow 613 614 (13.5m) and eutrophic and the third very shallow (2.5m) and very eutrophic. Cyanobacteria are present only in the second lake. Modelling results show an increase in phytoplankton biomass in summer and an increase 615 in the dominance of cyanobacteria in the second lake. The average annual biomass increases in the oligo-616 mesotrophic and eutrophic lakes but decreases in the highly eutrophic lake. The phytoplankton biomass de-617 618 creases in winter and spring, especially diatoms.

A recent analysis of ten modelling studies (Elliott, 2012) on the impact of climate change on cyanobacteria has shown an increase in the relative abundance of cyanobacteria with an increase in water temperature, an increase in the residence time of the water and an increase in nutrient loading by the catchment.

The direct effects of climate change mainly relate to phenology of phytoplankton dynamics but little to the annual amount of total biomass. These changes in phytoplankton succession may result in nitrogen limitation in some lakes, and thus favour the dominance of nitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria. In addition, warmer water in spring can increase nutrient uptake by the phytoplankton community, which in some lakes causes nitrogen limitation later in the year, potentially favourable for some nitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria. The increase in the relative abundance of cyanobacteria may also impact the higher levels of the ecosystem food web due to the low grazing of cyanobacteria by zooplankton. 629 3.6

Coupled models of lake and watershed

630 Coupling watershed modelling and lake response modelling is a key issue for an efficient use of models in 631 eutrophication control. But to our knowledge, few research results are still available.

Most often, the coupling between watershed model and lake model is not effective. A hydrological model of 632 633 Lake Cayuga watershed (USA) has provided estimates of nutrient loading by lake tributaries (Haith et al., 2012). But this watershed model is not coupled with a model of the lake itself. This is also the case for Lake 634 Gucheng watershed in China (Huang et al., 2009) or for Lake Tahoe watershed (USA) (Riverson et al., 635 636 2013).

Since the 2000s, integrated modelling of the watershed and the lake has been undertaken. Lake watershed 637 modelling is conducted with the objective of providing the lake model with input data to then simulate the 638 lake response to watershed loadings. But the limits of these coupled models come from the cumulative un-639 certainties of the hydrological model and the lake model. If the inflows are fairly well simulated, the main 640 641 uncertainties are due to errors in computing nutrient concentrations in the lake tributaries (Liu et al., 2006; 642 Silva et al., 2016; van Puijenbroek et al., 2004).

643 Carraro et al. (2012b) propose for Lake Pusiano (Northern Italy) a coupled model of loading by the watershed (SWAT model) and a deterministic model of the lake response (DYRESM-CAEDYM model). The 644 results obtained for different scenarios are discussed and compared, but no quantified recommendation for a 645 percentage of reduction in loadings or concentrations to be achieved is given. 646

647 Very few studies have focused on coupling climate, watershed and lake models. To study phytoplankton biomass in a large shallow lake, Lake Malaren (Sweden), a regional climate model, a hydrological model, 648 649 and a lake model were used in sequence (Markensten et al., 2010). In this lake, warming increases the duration of phytoplankton production, slightly increases total biomass, and modifies the phytoplankton composi-650 651 tion to the advantage of nitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria. According to the authors, the change in the hydro-652 logical regime and therefore the nutrient loading to the lake drives the dominance of cyanobacteria.

653 The aquatic continuum, from headwaters to the ocean, is at the heart of current research on biogeochemical 654 processes in inland waters. This is reflected in the topic of the special issue of Limnology and Oceanography, 655 a reference journal in the field, entitled "Headwaters to oceans: ecological and biogeochemical contrasts across the aquatic continuum" (Xenopoulos et al., 2017). In this area, progress on knowledge integration is rapid and modelling of the continuum, still in its infancy, should make significant progress in the coming years.

659

660 4 Discussion and perspectives

661 The development of lake eutrophication models is still a growing field in limnology. However several authors complain that the performances of the biological models remain relatively low (Mooij et al., 2010; 662 Shimoda and Arhonditsis, 2016). According to Trolle et al., (2011a), the problem is not the "lack of knowl-663 edge about ecosystem functioning, but rather the limited extent of open communication, inadequate collabo-664 ration and lack of suitable structure to support the aquatic scientific modelling community". In their paper, 665 these authors argue for the adoption of good practices for developing, using and sharing models effectively 666 and correctly, which should help improving the models. Mooij et al. (2010) identified two challenges for 667 making further progress in lake ecosystem modelling: to avoid developing more models largely following 668 the concept of others ('reinventing the wheel') and to avoid focusing on only one type of model, while ignor-669 ing new and diverse approaches that have become available ('having tunnel vision')" (Mooij et al., 2010a). 670 671 This suggests to merge different modelling approaches, such as 1D hydrodynamic-ecological model and 672 super individual-based model (Makler-Pick et al., 2011), or machine learning models and physical dynamical 673 models (Crisci et al., 2017).

674 To improve the models, the complexity of the predictive ecosystem models should also be increased, because 675 "there is a lot of knowledge that we are not using" (Hellweger, 2017). The most striking example is the almost systematic use of the Monod function for representing the growth of a phytoplankton population 676 whereas the use of internal (vs. external) nutrient quota (Droop, 1968) could be represented (Hellweger, 677 2017). Another example is the use of Michaelis-Menten kinetics for nutrient uptake by phytoplankton, which 678 679 does not enable to represent the variable stoichiometry of biomass and of nutrient uptake (Flynn, 2010, 2005; 680 Smith et al., 2014) whereas size- and trait-based kinetics give promising results (Fiksen et al., 2013; Smith et al., 2014). In the same way, the process of mineralization of the organic matter by bacteria, which has been 681 682 proved to be important for the cyanobacteria dynamics, is often represented as a simple chemical reaction 683 with a rate either constant or dependent on the bacteria concentration at best (Li et al., 2014). Xu et al. (2015)

also claim that the use of more advanced statistical methods, such a quantile regression, can improve themodels of lake eutrophication.

Even if the relationship between complexity and uncertainty of models is not so clear (Håkanson, 1995; Hellweger, 2017; Jørgensen, 1990), it is obvious that the outcomes of simulated scenarios are limited by great uncertainty (Arhonditsis and Brett, 2004). Some authors have attempted to quantify model errors due to uncertainty (Bennett et al., 2013; Hongping and Yong, 2003; Reckhow, 1994; Scavia et al., 1981; Snodgrass, 1985; Stow et al., 1997; Van Straten and Keesman, 1991), but few models include thorough uncertainty analyses (Hongping and Yong, 2003).

692 This uncertainty partly comes from the large set of parameters (sometimes more than 100) to be calibrated. To quantify the effect of parameter uncertainties on the model outputs, sensitivity analysis can be conducted 693 (Arhonditsis et al., 2007; Brett et al., 2016; Janse et al., 2010; Yi et al., 2016). However, as for general uncer-694 695 tainty analysis, sensitivity analysis is not always performed. Two articles (Arhonditsis and Brett, 2004; Shimoda and Arhonditsis, 2016) have investigated whether the conventional methodological procedures for 696 sensitivity analysis, calibration and validation, are reported in the papers or not. They show that only half of 697 the papers present sensitivity analysis results and that "manual" or "trial and error" calibration is the most 698 699 applied calibration procedure. Very few papers use automatic calibration procedures that are either based on 700 optimization or on Monte Carlo and Bayesian inference. Moreover these papers only deal with 0D or 1D 701 models.

Another part of output uncertainty comes from the model structure itself. To reduce it, several "ensemble approaches" have been proposed, similar to those used for weather forecasts. In (Gal et al., 2014; Nielsen et al., 2014) an ensemble of model runs obtained with several "equivalent" set of parameters are used to improve the model predictive power. In (Trolle et al., 2014), the same scenario is simulated using an ensemble of models. Bayesian model averaging (BMA) can also be used to improve the predictive performance of the models (Hamilton et al., 2009).

Another effective way is to conduct cross-comparisons of similar models on the same study sites. This type of comparative studies has been performed recently for 1D models (Bruce et al., 2018; Perroud et al., 2009; Stepanenko et al., 2012, 2010). To our knowledge very few attempts have been made for hydrodynamicecological models (Trolle et al., 2014) and none for 3D models.

Nevertheless, to perform such studies, portability of the model software is required. This type of concern is 712 just starting to be addressed by the modeller community. A Fortran-based Framework for Aquatic Biogeo-713 chemical Models (FABM - Bruggeman and Bolding, 2014; Trolle et al., 2011) enables to easily couple hy-714 drodynamic models with ecological models, whereas the project "Framework for Interoperable Freshwater 715 716 Models" (FIFM) has investigated flexible computer-based frameworks for integrating freshwater models 717 (Elliott et al., 2014). The Database Approach To Modelling (DATM -Mooij et al., 2014) enables to auto-718 matically implement the same model under different frameworks. In order to facilitate the comparison of 719 models or the application of one model on several lakes, it is also necessary to share the codes and the data sets (Mooij et al., 2010a). Just as importantly, the datasets must be of good quality and enriched with meta-720 721 information (such as the type of sensor used and their accuracy). This is mandatory for the good interpretation and use of the data (Mooij et al., 2010a). The use of high-frequency sensors (Brentrup et al., 2016; Car-722 723 raro et al., 2012; Soulignac et al., 2017), as well as satellite images (Curtarelli et al., 2015; Dash et al., 2011; Tyler et al., 2006; Yacobi, 2006), will also enrich significantly the data sets. Using such enriched and good-724 quality data sets can improve the model performances. Indeed, the more data we use for calibration, com-725 726 parison with model outputs or to feed machine learning models, the greater the accuracy of the model will 727 be.

728

729 **5** Conclusion

730 Early lake eutrophication models in the 1970s were empirical models linking in-lake phosphorus and chlo-731 rophyll concentrations, as well as models of watershed nutrient loading and in-lake chlorophyll concentra-732 tion. These models, very easy to implement, were useful for providing targets of nutrient and chlorophyll 733 concentrations, required for reducing or controlling lake eutrophication. Dynamic deterministic models have 734 been then developed, whose characteristics are very diverse as regards the spatial dimension (well-mixed 735 system, 1D vertical to 3D models), the sediment exchange with the water column, the complexity of ecologi-736 cal functioning and the hydrodynamics. Most of these models represent the pelagic zone of the lake. The 737 most represented state variables include phytoplankton, considered as a single group or divided into main groups, nutrients (phosphorus and nitrogen) and oxygen. Among the phytoplankton groups, cyanobacteria 738 739 have been increasingly represented since the mid-2000s. The dynamics of macrophytes and their possible 740 competition with phytoplankton are accounted for in some rather recent models. One notable development over the past decade has been the modelling of phytoplankton dynamics based on the functional traits of 741 742 dominant species. The objectives of the modelling studies are frequently related to the assessment of the expected mid-and long-term evolution of lake eutrophication under the influence of global changes (nutri-743 744 ents, urbanization, climate...). Among these changes, the effects of global warming are the most frequently 745 addressed. At these time scales, a main barrier that models have to face, regards the evolution of the phytoplankton succession and its cascading effects on lake ecological functioning. Recent evolutions show a 746 747 strong coupling between modelling and acquisition of new types of experimental data (remote sensing, high frequency field sensors, biology molecular data...). A strong trend seen in papers published in the last dec-748 749 ade is the increasing number of application of 3D models coupled with satellite images of phytoplankton biomass spatial distribution. 750

751 6 Appendix

In this appendix, we first give some details about the method applied for obtaining the bibliographic corpus considered in this review. We then present some simple statistics about: (1) the number of publications and citations; (2) the general categories, research areas and journal titles; (3) the keywords of the references included in the bibliographic corpus.

756 **6.1 Selection of the bibliographic corpus**

The present review was performed, using the bibliographic search tool proposed by Web of Science. The first database search of February 2017 (Crave et al., 2017) was updated on 1^{rst} June 2018 with the following search equation:

TITLE=((eutrophic* OR oxygen* OR hypox* OR anox* OR phytoplankton* OR "harmful alga"* OR nutri ent* OR cyanobact* OR proliferat*) AND (model* OR numerical* OR simulat*) AND (lake* OR reser voir*))

All citation databases were consulted for all available years (from 1956 to 2018). Among the references obtained, we kept only the journal articles written in English. This query provided us with a list of 487 references from which we removed 49 references that were not relevant. We finally get a bibliographic corpus of 438 references among which 431 references are indexed in the Web of Science core collection, 62 in the

MEDLINE database, 1 in the KCI Korean Journal Database and 1 in the Scientific Electronic Library Online
 (SCIELO) database. Each reference may be indexed in several databases.

769 **6.2** Number of publications and citations

The first referenced paper (Droop, 1968) was published in 1968. Since then, the number of publications per year has obviously increased (Figure 3), following the global tendency observed for the total number of scientific publications. In average, 8.6 articles were published per year, and each article was cited 17 times. The total number of citations is 7447, which corresponds, since 1968, to a mean value of 146 citations per year.

Figure 3. Number of publications and citations per year, based on the ISI Web of Science citation report.

775

774

776 6.3 General categories, research areas and journal titles

The repartition of the references are given in terms of general categories, research areas and journal titles (Table 2). We note that most of the references of the bibliographic corpus come from the "science technology" and "life sciences biomedicine" categories. This shows that the studies are motivated both by academic objectives to improve knowledge and by more applied objectives to develop management strategies (see section 2.2). One third of the references (respectively one quarter) also belongs to the category of "physical sciences" (respectively "technologies"), knowing that one reference may belong to several categories.

The repartition according to the research areas shows that lake eutrophication modelling is a multidisciplinary field of research. Most of the references (two thirds) are in the field of "environmental sciences and ecology", but the research areas of "marine and freshwater biology", "water resources" and "engineering" also contain a significant number of references (from 20 to 30%). Note that some publications in "mathematics" and "computer science" are also included in the bibliographic corpus, which is not surprising as we focus on modelling studies.

The journal in which most papers (16%) have been published is "Ecological modelling", perhaps because it is one of the few journals in environmental sciences that only focus on modelling. The scope of the other most represented journals cover the research area of water sciences in general, without restriction to modelling approaches.

Table 2. Repartition of the publications according to their general categories, their research areas and the journal title (provided by Web of Science). Only the research areas (respectively the journal titles) that represent more than 2% (respectively
1.5%) of the bibliographic corpus are listed.

797

798 **6.4 Keywords**

An automatic search routine was implemented to sort the keywords according to the number of publications in which they appear. The routine does not search for an exact match but for an inclusion. For example, a publication with "lake models" as keyword will be counted for the keywords "lake model", "models", "model" and "lake". Only the keywords that appear in more than 20 publications of the bibliographic corpus have been considered. The obtained sorted list has then been divided in sub-groups as presented in Table 3. Not surprisingly, the most common keywords are "lake", "water" and "eutrophic".

This classification of the keywords give an interesting overview of the research works presented in the analysed bibliographic corpus. Each sub-group will be discussed more in details in the following sections.

807

808 Table 3. Classification of keywords according to the number of publications in which they appear.

809

810 7 Acknowledgements

This review was prepared within the framework of the joint scientific appraisal (ESCo) on eutrophication requested by the French ministries of the environment and agriculture and the French Agency for Biodiversity (AFB). The authors thank the ESCo steering committee for this great opportunity to write this review on lake eutrophication modelling. The authors also acknowledge the French Research Agency for funding the ANSWER project (ANR-16-CE32-0009). A detailed analysis of the existing process-based models was conducted by the authors within this French-Chinese Research Project that focuses on eutrophic lake ecosystem modelling to study the impact of anthropogenic environmental changes on the proliferation of cyanobacteria.

819 8 References

- Afshar, A., Saadatpour, M., Marino, M.A., 2012. Development of a Complex System Dynamic Eutrophication Model: Application to Karkheh Reservoir. Environ. Eng. Sci. 29, 373–385.
 https://doi.org/10.1089/ees.2010.0203
- Alonso Fernandez, J.R., Garcia Nieto, P.J., Diaz Muniz, C., Alvarez Anton, J.C., 2014. Modeling eutrophication and risk prevention in a reservoir in the Northwest of Spain by using multivariate adaptive regression splines analysis. Ecol. Eng. 68, 80–89. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2014.03.094
- Anagnostou, E., Gianni, A., Zacharias, I., 2017. Ecological modeling and eutrophication-A review. Nat.
 Resour. Model. 30, e12130. https://doi.org/10.1111/nrm.12130
- Anderson, D.M., Cembella, A.D., Hallegraeff, G.M., 2012. Progress in Understanding Harmful Algal
 Blooms: Paradigm Shifts and New Technologies for Research, Monitoring, and Management. Annu.
 Rev. Mar. Sci. 4, 143–176. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-marine-120308-081121
- Antonopoulos, V.Z., Gianniou, S.K., 2003. Simulation of water temperature and dissolved oxygen distribution in Lake Vegoritis, Greece. Ecol. Model. 160, 39–53. https://doi.org/10.1016/S03043800(02)00286-7
- Aparicio Medrano, E., Uittenbogaard, R.E., Dionisio Pires, L.M., van de Wiel, B.J.H., Clercx, H.J.H., 2013.
 Coupling hydrodynamics and buoyancy regulation in Microcystis aeruginosa for its vertical distribution in lakes. Ecol. Model. 248, 41–56. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2012.08.029
- Arhonditsis, G., Brett, M., 2004. Evaluation of the current state of mechanistic aquatic biogeochemical modeling. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 271, 13–26. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps271013
- Arhonditsis, G.B., Qian, S.S., Stow, C.A., Lamon, E.C., Reckhow, K.H., 2007. Eutrophication risk assessment using Bayesian calibration of process-based models: Application to a mesotrophic lake. Ecol.
 Model. 208, 215–229. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2007.05.020
- Arnell, N.W., Gosling, S.N., 2013. The impacts of climate change on river flow regimes at the global scale.
 J. Hydrol. 486, 351–364. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2013.02.010
- 844 Asaeda, T., Trung, V.K., Manatunge, J., 2000. Modeling the effects of macrophyte growth and decomposi-845 Shallow Lakes. 68, tion on the nutrient budget in Aquat. Bot. 217-237. 846 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3770(00)00123-6

- Asaeda, T., Trung, V.K., Manatunge, J., Van Bon, T., 2001. Modelling macrophyte-nutrient-phytoplankton
 interactions in shallow eutrophic lakes and the evaluation of environmental impacts. Ecol. Eng. 16,
- 849 341–357. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0925-8574(00)00120-8
- Asaeda, T., Van Bon, T., 1997. Modelling the effects of macrophytes on algal blooming in eutrophic shallow
 lakes. Ecol. Model. 104, 261–287. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(97)00129-4
- Bartram, J., Carmichael, W., Chorus, I., Jones, G., Skulberg, O., 1999. Introduction, in: Toxic Cyanobacteria
 in Water. Chorus I. and Bartram J., London and New York.
- Bell, V.A., George, D.G., Moore, R.J., Parker, J., 2006. Using a 1-D mixing model to simulate the vertical
 flux of heat and oxygen in a lake subject to episodic mixing. Ecol. Model. 190, 41–54.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2005.02.025
- Belov, A.P., Giles, J.D., 1997. Dynamical model of buoyant cyanobacteria 11.
- Beniston, M., Stephenson, D.B., Christensen, O.B., Ferro, C.A.T., Frei, C., Goyette, S., Halsnaes, K., Holt,
 T., Jylhä, K., Koffi, B., Palutikof, J., Schöll, R., Semmler, T., Woth, K., 2007. Future extreme events
 in European climate: an exploration of regional climate model projections. Clim. Change 81, 71–95.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-006-9226-z
- Bennett, N.D., Croke, B.F.W., Guariso, G., Guillaume, J.H.A., Hamilton, S.H., Jakeman, A.J., MarsiliLibelli, S., Newham, L.T.H., Norton, J.P., Perrin, C., Pierce, S.A., Robson, B., Seppelt, R., Voinov,
- A.A., Fath, B.D., Andreassian, V., 2013. Characterising performance of environmental models. Environ. Model. Softw. 40, 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2012.09.011
- Benoy, G.A., Jenkinson, R.W., Robertson, D.M., Saad, D.A., 2016. Nutrient delivery to Lake Winnipeg from
 the RedAssiniboine River Basin A binational application of the SPARROW model. Can. WATER
 Resour. J. 41, 429–447. https://doi.org/10.1080/07011784.2016.1178601
- Bernhardt, J., Elliott, J.A., Jones, I.D., 2008. Modelling the effects on phytoplankton communities of changing mixed depth and background extinction coefficient on three contrasting lakes in the English Lake
 District. Freshw. Biol. 53, 2573–2586. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2427.2008.02083.x
- Bhagowati, B., Ahamad, K.U., 2018. A review on lake eutrophication dynamics and recent developments in
 lake modeling. Ecohydrol. Hydrobiol. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecohyd.2018.03.002

- Bonnet, M., Poulin, M., 2004. DyLEM-1D: a 1D physical and biochemical model for planktonic succession,
 nutrients and dissolved oxygen cycling application to a hyper-eutrophic reservoir. Ecol. Model. 180,
 317–344. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2004.04.037
- Brentrup, J.A., Williamson, C.E., Colom-Montero, W., Eckert, W., de Eyto, E., Grossart, H.-P., Huot, Y.,
 Isles, P.D.F., Knoll, L.B., Leach, T.H., McBride, C.G., Pierson, D., Pomati, F., Read, J.S., Rose,
- 879 K.C., Samal, N.R., Staehr, P.A., Winslow, L.A., 2016. The potential of high-frequency profiling to
- 880 assess vertical and seasonal patterns of phytoplankton dynamics in lakes: an extension of the Plank-
- ton Ecology Group (PEG) model. INLAND WATERS 6, 565–580. https://doi.org/10.5268/IW 6.4.890
- Brett, M.T., Ahopelto, S.K., Brown, H.K., Brynestad, B.E., Butcher, T.W., Coba, E.E., Curtis, C.A., Dara,
- J.T., Doeden, K.B., Evans, K.R., Fan, L., Finley, J.D., Garguilo, N.J., Gebreeyesus, S.M., Goodman,
- 885 M.K., Gray, K.W., Grinnell, C., Gross, K.L., Hite, B.R.E., Jones, A.J., Kenyon, P.T., Klock, A.M.,
- Koshy, R.E., Lawler, A.M., Lu, M., Martinkosky, L., Miller-Schulze, J.R., Nguyen, Q.T.N., Runde,
- E.R., Stultz, J.M., Wang, S., White, F.P., Wilson, C.H., Wong, A.S., Wu, S.Y., Wurden, P.G.,
 Young, T.R., Arhonditsis, G.B., 2016. The modeled and observed response of Lake Spokane
 hypolimnetic dissolved oxygen concentrations to phosphorus inputs. LAKE Reserv. Manag. 32,
 246–258. https://doi.org/10.1080/10402381.2016.1170079
- Brito, D., Neves, R., Branco, M.A., Goncalves, M.C., Ramos, T.B., 2017. Modeling flood dynamics in a
 temporary river draining to an eutrophic reservoir in southeast Portugal. Environ. EARTH Sci. 76.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-017-6713-7
- Brown, C., Hoyer, M., Bachmann, R., Canfield, D., 2000. Nutrient-chlorophyll relationships: an evaluation
 of empirical nutrient-chlorophyll models using Florida and north-temperate lake data. Can. J. Fish.
 Aquat. Sci. 57, 1574–1583. https://doi.org/10.1139/f00-090
- Bruce, L.C., Frassl, M.A., Arhonditsis, G.B., Gal, G., Hamilton, D.P., Hanson, P.C., Hetherington, A.L.,
 Melack, J.M., Read, J.S., Rinke, K., Rigosi, A., Trolle, D., Winslow, L., Adrian, R., Ayala, A.I.,
 Bocaniov, S.A., Boehrer, B., Boon, C., Brookes, J.D., Bueche, T., Busch, B.D., Copetti, D., Cortés,
- 900 A., de Eyto, E., Elliott, J.A., Gallina, N., Gilboa, Y., Guyennon, N., Huang, L., Kerimoglu, O.,

- 901 Lenters, J.D., MacIntyre, S., Makler-Pick, V., McBride, C.G., Moreira, S., Özkundakci, D., Pilotti,
- 902 M., Rueda, F.J., Rusak, J.A., Samal, N.R., Schmid, M., Shatwell, T., Snorthheim, C., Soulignac, F.,
- 903 Valerio, G., van der Linden, L., Vetter, M., Vincon-Leite, B., Wang, J., Weber, M., Wickramaratne,
- 904 C., Woolway, R.I., Yao, H., Hipsey, M.R., 2018. A multi-lake comparative analysis of the General
- 905 Lake Model (GLM): Stress-testing across a global observatory network. Environ. Model. Softw.
 906 102, 274–291. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2017.11.016
- Bruce, L.C., Hamilton, D., Imberger, J., Gal, G., Gophen, M., Zohary, T., Hambright, K.D., 2006. A numerical simulation of the role of zooplankton in C, N and P cycling in Lake Kinneret, Israel. Ecol. Model. 193, 412–436. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2005.09.008
- Bruggeman, J., Bolding, K., 2014. A general framework for aquatic biogeochemical models. Environ. Model. Softw. 61, 249–265.
- Burger, D.F., Hamilton, D.P., Pilditch, C.A., 2008. Modelling the relative importance of internal and external
 nutrient loads on water column nutrient concentrations and phytoplankton biomass in a shallow
 polymictic lake. Ecol. Model. 211, 411–423. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2007.09.028
- 915 Carey, C.C., Ibelings, B.W., Hoffmann, E.P., Hamilton, D.P., Brookes, J.D., 2012. Eco-physiological adapta916 tions that favour freshwater cyanobacteria in a changing climate. Water Res. 46, 1394–1407.
 917 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2011.12.016
- 918 Carraro, E., Guyennon, N., Hamilton, D., Valsecchi, L., Manfredi, E.C., Viviano, G., Salerno, F., Tartari, G.,
- Copetti, D., 2012. Coupling high-resolution measurements to a three-dimensional lake model to assess the spatial and temporal dynamics of the cyanobacterium Planktothrix rubescens in a mediumsized lake. Hydrobiologia 698, 77–95. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-012-1096-y
- Carvalho, L., Miller nee (Ferguson), C.A., Scott, E.M., Codd, G.A., Davies, P.S., Tyler, A.N., 2011.
 Cyanobacterial blooms: Statistical models describing risk factors for national-scale lake assessment
 and lake management. Sci. TOTAL Environ. 409, 5353–5358.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2011.09.030

- 926 Cha, Y., Park, S.S., Kim, K., Byeon, M., Stow, C.A., 2014. Probabilistic prediction of cyanobacteria abun-
- dance in a Korean reservoir using a Bayesian Poisson model. WATER Resour. Res. 50, 2518–2532.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/2013WR014372
- 929 Chanudet, V., Fabre, V., van der Kaaij, T., 2012. Application of a three-dimensional hydrodynamic model to
- 930 the Theun 2 Reservoir PDR). J. Gt. Lakes 38, 260-269. Nam (Lao Res. 931 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jglr.2012.01.008
- Chapra, S.C., Canale, R.P., 1991. Long-term phenomenological model of phosphorus and oxygen for stratified lakes. Water Res. 25, 707–715. https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354(91)90046-S
- Chaves, P., Kojiri, T., 2007. Conceptual fuzzy neural network model for water quality simulation. Hydrol.
 Process. 21, 634–646. https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.6279
- Chen, W.-B., Liu, W.-C., 2014. Artificial neural network modeling of dissolved oxygen in reservoir. Environ. Monit. Assess. 186, 1203–1217. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-013-3450-6
- Chung, E.G., Bombardelli, F.A., Schladow, S.G., 2009. Modeling linkages between sediment resuspension
 and water quality in a shallow, eutrophic, wind-exposed lake. Ecol. Model. 220, 1251–1265.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2009.01.038
- Crave, A., Lacroix G., Durand P., Vinçon-Leite B., Ménesguen A., Sánchez-Pérez J.-M., Sauvage S., Sauvage, S., 2017. Modélisation de l'eutrophisation, in: L'eutrophisation: Manifestations, Causes,
 Conséquences et Prédictibilité. Rapport d'Expertise Scientifique Collective. pp. 648–789.
- Crisci, C., Terra, R., Pacheco, J.P., Ghattas, B., Bidegain, M., Goyenola, G., Lagomarsino, J.J., Méndez, G.,
 Mazzeo, N., 2017. Multi-model approach to predict phytoplankton biomass and composition dynam-
- 946 ics in a eutrophic shallow lake governed by extreme meteorological events. Ecol. Model. 360, 80–
- 947 93. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2017.06.017
- Cui, Y., Zhu, G., Li, H., Luo, L., Cheng, X., Jin, Y., Trolle, D., 2016. Modeling the response of phytoplank ton to reduced external nutrient load in a subtropical Chinese reservoir using DYRESM-CAEDYM.
- 950 LAKE Reserv. Manag. 32, 146–157. https://doi.org/10.1080/10402381.2015.1136365

- Curtarelli, M.P., Ogashawara, I., Alcântara, E.H., Stech, J.L., 2015. Coupling remote sensing bio-optical and
 three-dimensional hydrodynamic modeling to study the phytoplankton dynamics in a tropical hydro electric reservoir. Remote Sens. Environ. 157, 185–198. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2014.06.013
- Dash, P., Walker, N.D., Mishra, D.R., Hu, C., Pinckney, J.L., D'Sa, E.J., 2011. Estimation of cyanobacterial
 pigments in a freshwater lake using OCM satellite data. Remote Sens. Environ. 115, 3409–3423.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2011.08.004
- De Senerpont Domis, L.N., Van de Waal, D.B., Helmsing, N.R., Van Donk, E., Mooij, W.M., 2014. Community stoichiometry in a changing world: combined effects of warming and eutrophication on phy toplankton dynamics. Ecology 95, 1485–1495. https://doi.org/10.1890/13-1251.1
- DeAngelis, D.L., Mooij, W.M., 2005. Individual-based modeling of ecological and evolutionary processes.
 Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst. 36, 147–168.
 https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.36.102003.152644
- Deus, R., Brito, D., Kenov, I.A., Lima, M., Costa, V., Medeiros, A., Neves, R., Alves, C.N., 2013. Threedimensional model for analysis of spatial and temporal patterns of phytoplankton in Tucuruí reservoir, Pará, Brazil. Ecol. Model. 253, 28–43. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2012.10.013
- Diaz Muniz, C., Alonso Fernandez, J.R., Garcia Nieto, P.J., Alvarez Anton, J.C., 2015. Modelling algal ab normal proliferation in a reservoir using support vector regression: a case study.
 ECOHYDROLOGY 8, 1109–1118. https://doi.org/10.1002/eco.1568
- Dillon, P.J., Rigler, F.H., 1974a. The phosphorus-chlorophyll relationship in lakes1,2: Phosphoruschlorophyll relationship. Limnol. Oceanogr. 19, 767–773. https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.1974.19.5.0767
- Dillon, P.J., Rigler, F.H., 1974b. A Test of a Simple Nutrient Budget Model Predicting the Phosphorus Concentration in Lake Water. J. Fish. Res. Board Can. 31, 1771–1778. https://doi.org/10.1139/f74-225
- Ditoro, D., Thomas, N., Herdendorf, C., Winfield, R., Connolly, J.P., 1987. A post audit of a lake Erie eutrophication model. J. Gt. Lakes Res. 13, 801–825. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0380-1330(87)71692-X
- 975 Dodds, W.K., 2006. Eutrophication and trophic state in rivers and streams. Limnol. Oceanogr. 51, 671–680.
- 976 https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2006.51.1_part_2.0671

- Droop, M.R., 1968. Vitamin B12 and Marine Ecology. IV. The Kinetics of Uptake, Growth and Inhibition in
 Monochrysis Lutheri. J. Mar. Biol. Assoc. U. K. 48, 689.
 https://doi.org/10.1017/S0025315400019238
- Easthope, M.P., Howard, A., 1999. Simulating cyanobacterial growth in a lowland reservoir. Sci. Total Envi ron. 241, 17–25. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-9697(99)00278-8
- Elliott, 2011. Predicting the impact of changing nutrient load and temperature on the phytoplankton of England's largest lake, Windermere. Freshw. Biol. 1365–2427.
- Elliott, A., Turek, G., Snow, V., Rutledge, D., Ritchie, A., Herzig, A., 2014. Testing Tales: Selection and
 Evaluation of a Framework for Interoperable Freshwater Modelling, in: Proceedings of the 7th International Congress on Environmental Modelling and Software. Presented at the 7th International
 Congress on Environmental Modelling and Software, International Environmental Modelling and
 Software Society (iEMSs), San Diego, California, USA., p. 9.
- Elliott, J., Thackeray, S., 2004. The simulation of phytoplankton in shallow and deep lakes using PROTECH.
 Ecol. Model. 178, 357–369. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2004.02.012
- Elliott, J., Thackeray, S., Huntingford, C., Jones, R., 2005. Combining a regional climate model with a phytoplankton community model to predict future changes in phytoplankton in lakes. Freshw. Biol. 50,
 1404–1411. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2427.2005.01409.x
- Elliott, J.A., 2012. Is the future blue-green? A review of the current model predictions of how climate change
 could affect pelagic freshwater cyanobacteria. Water Res. 46, 1364–1371.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2011.12.018
- Elliott, J.A., Defew, L., 2012. Modelling the response of phytoplankton in a shallow lake (Loch Leven, UK)
 to changes in lake retention time and water temperature. HYDROBIOLOGIA 681, 105–116.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-011-0930-y
- Elliott, J.A., Persson, I., Thackeray, S.J., Blenckner, T., 2007. Phytoplankton modelling of Lake Erken, Sweden by linking the models PROBE and PROTECH. Ecol. Model. 202, 421–426.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2006.11.004

- Elliott, Jones, I.D., Page, T., 2009. The importance of nutrient source in determining the influence of retention time on phytoplankton: an explorative modelling study of a naturally well-flushed lake. Hydrobiologia 627, 129–142. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-009-9720-1
- Elshaarawi, A., 1984. Dissolved-oxygen concentrations in Lake Erie (USA-Canada) .2. A statistical-model
 for dissolved-oxygen in the central basin of Lake Erie. J. Hydrol. 72, 231–243.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/0022-1694(84)90082-9
- Elshorbagy, A., Ormsbee, L., 2006. Object-oriented modeling approach to surface water quality management. Environ. Model. Softw. 21, 689–698. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2005.02.001
- 1011 European Environment Agency, 2012. Climate change, impacts and vulnerability in Europe 2012 (Publica-1012 tion).
- Everett, J.D., Baird, M.E., Suthers, I.M., 2007. Nutrient and plankton dynamics in an intermittently
 closed/open lagoon, Smiths Lake, south-eastern Australia: An ecological model. Estuar. Coast. Shelf
 Sci. 72, 690–702. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2006.12.001
- Fadel, A., Lemaire, B.J., Vincon-Leite, B., Atoui, A., Slim, K., Tassin, B., 2017. On the successful use of a
 simplified model to simulate the succession of toxic cyanobacteria in a hypereutrophic reservoir with
- 1018 a highly fluctuating water level. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 24, 20934–20948.
 1019 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-017-9723-9
- Fang, X., Stefan, H., 1997. Simulated climate change effects on dissolved oxygen characteristics in icecovered lakes. Ecol. Model. 103, 209–229. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(97)00086-0
- Fang, X., Stefan, H.G., 2009. Simulations of climate effects on water temperature, dissolved oxygen, and ice
 and snow covers in lakes of the contiguous United States under past and future climate scenarios.
 Limnol. Oceanogr. 54, 2359–2370. https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2009.54.6_part_2.2359
- 1025 Fennel, K., Collier, R., Larson, G., Crawford, G., Boss, E., 2007. Seasonal nutrient and plankton dynamics in
- 1026a physical-biological model of Crater Lake. Hydrobiologia 574, 265–280.1027https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-006-2615-5

- Fernandez, J.A., Clavero, V., Villalobos, J.A., Niell, F.X., 1997. A non-linear model of phosphorus flux in
 the phytoplankton of a temperate eutrophic reservoir. Hydrobiologia 344, 205–214.
 https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1002910529075
- Fiksen, Ø., Follows, M.J., Aksnes, D.L., 2013. Trait-based models of nutrient uptake in microbes extend the
 Michaelis-Menten framework. Limnol. Oceanogr. 58, 193–202.
 https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2013.58.1.0193
- Flynn, K.J., 2010. Ecological modelling in a sea of variable stoichiometry: Dysfunctionality and the legacy
 of Redfield and Monod. Prog. Oceanogr. 84, 52–65. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pocean.2009.09.006
- Flynn, K.J., 2005. Castles built on sand: dysfunctionality in plankton models and the inadequacy of dialogue
 between biologists and modellers. J. Plankton Res. 27, 1205–1210.
 https://doi.org/10.1093/plankt/fbi099
- Fornarelli, R., Galelli, S., Castelletti, A., Antenucci, J.P., Marti, C.L., 2013. An empirical modeling approach
 to predict and understand phytoplankton dynamics in a reservoir affected by interbasin water transfers. WATER Resour. Res. 49, 3626–3641. https://doi.org/10.1002/wrcr.20268
- Fragoso, C.R., Motta Marques, D.M.L., Collischonn, W., Tucci, C.E.M., van Nes, E.H., 2008. Modelling
 spatial heterogeneity of phytoplankton in Lake Mangueira, a large shallow subtropical lake in South
 Brazil. Ecol. Model. 219, 125–137. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2008.08.004
- 1045 Frisk, T., 1982. An oxygen model for Lake Haukivesi. Hydrobiologia 86, 7.
 1046 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00005800
- Frisk, T., Bilaletdin, A., Kaipainen, H., Malve, O., Mols, M., 1999. Modelling phytoplankton dynamics of
 the eutrophic Lake Vortsjarv, Estonia. Hydrobiologia 414, 59–69.
 https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1003802912687
- Gal, G., Hipsey, M.R., Parparov, A., Wagner, U., Makler, V., Zohary, T., 2009. Implementation of ecological modeling as an effective management and investigation tool: Lake Kinneret as a case study. Ecol.
 Model. 220, 1697–1718. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2009.04.010

- Gal, G., Makler-Pick, V., Shachar, N., 2014. Dealing with uncertainty in ecosystem model scenarios: Application of the single-model ensemble approach. Environ. Model. Softw. 61, 360–370.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2014.05.015
- Garcia-Nieto, P.J., Garcia-Gonzalo, E., Alonso Fernandez, J.R., Diaz Muniz, C., 2018. Predictive modelling
 of eutrophication in the Pozn de la Dolores lake (Northern Spain) by using an evolutionary support
 vector machines approach. J. Math. Biol. 76, 817–840. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00285-017-1161-2
- 1059 Giguet-Covex, C., Arnaud, F., Poulenard, J., Enters, D., Reyss, J.-L., Millet, L., Lazzaroto, J., Vidal, O.,
- 2010. Sedimentological and geochemical records of past trophic state and hypolimnetic anoxia in
 large, hard-water Lake Bourget, French Alps. J. Paleolimnol. 43, 171–190.
- 1062 Gkelis, S., Zaoutsos, N., 2014. Cyanotoxin occurrence and potentially toxin producing cyanobacteria in
 1063 freshwaters of Greece: A multi-disciplinary approach. Toxicon 78, 1–9.
 1064 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.toxicon.2013.11.010
- Gudimov, A., McCulloch, J., Chen, J., Doan, P., Arhonditsis, G., Dittrich, M., 2016. Modeling the interplay
 between deepwater oxygen dynamics and sediment diagenesis in a hard-water mesotrophic lake.
 Ecol. Inform. 31, 59–69. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoinf.2015.11.005
- Gulliver, J., Stephan, H., 1982. Lake phytoplankton model with destratification. J. Environ. Eng. Div.-Asce
 1069 108, 864–882.
- 1070 Guven, B., Howard, A., 2006. A review and classification of the existing models of cyanobacteria. Prog.
 1071 Phys. Geogr. 30, 1–24. https://doi.org/10.1191/0309133306pp464ra
- 1072 Haith, D.A., Hollingshead, N., Bell, M.L., Kreszewski, S.W., Morey, S.J., 2012. Nutrient Loads to Cayuga
- 1073 Lake, New York: Watershed Modeling on a Budget. J. WATER Resour. Plan. Manag.-ASCE 138,
- 1074 571–580. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)WR.1943-5452.0000198
- 1075 Håkanson, L., 1995. Optimal size of predictive models. Ecol. Model. 78, 195–204.
 1076 https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(93)E0103-A
- Hallstan, S., Johnson, R.K., Willén, E., Grandin, U., 2012. Comparison of classification-then-modelling and
 species-by-species modelling for predicting lake phytoplankton assemblages. Ecol. Model. 231, 11–
- 1079 19. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2012.01.018

- 1080 Hamblin, P.F., Bootsma, H.A., Hecky, R.E., 2003. Modeling Nutrient Upwelling in Lake Malawi/Nyasa. J.
- 1081 Gt. Lakes Res. 29, 34–47. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0380-1330(03)70537-1
- Hamilton, D.P., Schladow, S.G., 1997. Prediction of water quality in lakes and reservoirs. Part I Model
 description. Ecol. Model. 96, 91–110. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(96)00062-2
- Hamilton, G., McVinish, R., Mengersen, K., 2009. Bayesian model averaging for harmful algal bloom prediction. Ecol. Appl. 19, 1805–1814. https://doi.org/10.1890/08-1843.1
- 1086 Harada, M., Douma, A., Hiramatsu, K., Nguyen, D.T., Marui, A., 2013. Analysis of seasonal changes in
- 1087 water qualities in eutrophic reservoirs in a flat low-lying agricultural area using an algae-based eco1088 system model: water quality analysis using an algae-based ecosystem model. Irrig. Drain. 62, 24–35.
 1089 https://doi.org/10.1002/ird.1770
- Hassan, H., Hanaki, K., Matsuo, T., 1998. A modeling approach to simulate impact of climate change in lake
 water quality: Phytoplankton growth rate assessment. WATER Sci. Technol. 37, 177–185.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0273-1223(98)00022-5
- Hellweger, F.L., 2017. 75 years since Monod: It is time to increase the complexity of our predictive ecosystem models (opinion). Ecol. Model. 346, 77–87. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2016.12.001
- Hellweger, F.L., Kravchuk, E.S., Novotny, V., Gladyshev, M.I., 2008. Agent-based modeling of the complex
 life cycle of a cyanobacterium (Anabaena) in a shallow reservoir. Limnol. Oceanogr. 53, 1227–1241.
- 1097 https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2008.53.4.1227
- Hense, I., 2010. Approaches to model the life cycle of harmful algae. J. Mar. Syst. 83, 108–114.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmarsys.2010.02.014
- Hense, I., Beckmann, A., 2010. The representation of cyanobacteria life cycle processes in aquatic ecosystem
 models. Ecol. Model. 221, 2330–2338. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2010.06.014
- Hense, I., Beckmann, A., 2006. Towards a model of cyanobacteria life cycle—effects of growing and resting
 stages on bloom formation of N2-fixing species. Ecol. Model. 195, 205–218.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2005.11.018

- Hillmer, I., van Reenen, P., Imberger, J., Zohary, T., 2008. Phytoplankton patchiness and their role in the
 modelled productivity of a large, seasonally stratified lake. Ecol. Model. 218, 49–59.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2008.06.017
- Hipsey, M., Antenucci, J., Hamilton, D., 2011. Computational aquatic ecosystem dynamics model:
 CAEDYM v3.2, Science Manual. Univ. West. Aust.
- Hollander, D.J., McKenzie, J.A., Hsu, K.J., Huc, A.Y., 1993. Application of an eutrophic lake model to the
 origin of ancient organic-carbon-rich sediments. Glob. Biogeochem. Cycles 7, 157–179.
 https://doi.org/10.1029/92GB02831
- Hongping, P., Yong, W., 2003. Eutrophication research of West Lake, Hangzhou, China: modeling under
 uncertainty. Water Res. 37, 416–428. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0043-1354(02)00287-7
- Hou, G., Song, L., Liu, J., Xiao, B., Liu, Y., 2004. Modeling of cyanobacterial blooms in hypereutrophic
 Lake Dianchi, China. J. Freshw. Ecol. 19, 623–629. https://doi.org/10.1080/02705060.2004.9664743
- Howard, A., Easthope, M., 2002. Application of a model to predict cyanobacterial growth patterns in response to climatic change at Farmoor Reservoir, Oxfordshire, UK. Sci. TOTAL Environ. 282, 459–
 469. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-9697(01)00929-9
- Howard, A., Irish, A.E., Reynolds, C.S., 1996. A new simulation of cyanobacterial underwater movement
 (SCUM'96). J. Plankton Res. 18, 1375–1385. https://doi.org/10.1093/plankt/18.8.1375
- Huang, J., Gao, J., Hoermann, G., 2012. Hydrodynamic-phytoplankton model for short-term forecasts of
 phytoplankton in Lake Taihu, China. Limnologica 42, 7–18.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.limno.2011.06.003
- Huang, J., Gao, J., Hoermann, G., Fohrer, N., 2014. Modeling the effects of environmental variables on
 short-term spatial changes in phytoplankton biomass in a large shallow lake, Lake Taihu. Environ.
 Earth Sci. 72, 3609–3621. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-014-3272-z
- Huang, J., Gao, J., Liu, J., Zhang, Y., 2013. State and parameter update of a hydrodynamic-phytoplankton
 model using ensemble Kalman filter. Ecol. Model. 263, 81–91.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2013.04.022

- Huang, J., Xu, Q., Wang, X., Xi, B., Jia, K., Huo, S., Liu, H., Li, C., Xu, B., 2015. Evaluation of a Modified
- 1132 Monod Model for Predicting Algal Dynamics in Lake Tai. Water 7, 3626–3642. 1133 https://doi.org/10.3390/w7073626
- 1134 Huang, Z., Xue, B., Pang, Y., 2009. Simulation on stream flow and nutrient loadings in Gucheng Lake, Low Quat. 1135 Yangtze River Basin, based SWAT model. 208, 109-115. on Int. 1136 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quaint.2008.12.018
- Huszar, V.L.M., Caraco, N.F., Roland, F., Cole, J., 2006. Nutrient-chlorophyll relationships in tropical subtropical lakes: do temperate models fit? Biogeochemistry 79, 239–250.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-006-9007-9
- Ieong, I.I., Lou, I., Ung, W.K., Mok, K.M., 2015. Using Principle Component Regression, Artificial Neural
 Network, and Hybrid Models for Predicting Phytoplankton Abundance in Macau Storage Reservoir.
 Environ. Model. Assess. 20, 355–365. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10666-014-9433-3
- Imboden, D.M., 1974. Phosphorus model of lake eutrophication: P model of lake eutrophication. Limnol.
 Oceanogr. 19, 297–304. https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.1974.19.2.0297
- Imboden, D.M., Gächter, R., 1978. A dynamic lake model for trophic state prediction. Ecol. Model. 4, 77–
 98. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(78)90001-7
- Inkala, A., Hellsten, S., Heikkinen, M., 1998. Integrated 3D modelling of water circulation and the dynamics
 of phytoplankton; the effects of a planned reservoir. Int. Rev. Hydrobiol. 83, 681–688.
- Janse, J.H., Scheffer, M., Lijklema, L., Van Liere, L., Sloot, J.S., Mooij, W.M., 2010. Estimating the critical
 phosphorus loading of shallow lakes with the ecosystem model PCLake: Sensitivity, calibration and
 uncertainty. Ecol. Model. 221, 654–665. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2009.07.023
- 1152 Jayaweera, M., Asaeda, T., 1996. Modeling of biomanipulation in shallow, eutrophic lakes: An application
- 1153
 to
 Lake
 Bleiswijkse
 Zoom,
 the
 Netherlands.
 Ecol.
 Model.
 85,
 113–127.

 1154
 https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(94)00153-7
- Jenny, J.P., Arnaud, F., Dorioz, J.M., Covex, C.G., Frossard, V., Sabatier, P., Millet, L., Reyss, J.L.,
 Tachikawa, K., Bard, E., Pignol, C., Soufi, F., Romeyer, O., Perga, M.E., 2013. A spatiotemporal investigation of varved sediments highlights the dynamics of hypolimnetic hypoxia in a large hard-

- 1158 water lake over the last 150 years. Limnol. Oceanogr. 58, 1395–1408.
 1159 https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2013.58.4.1395
- Ji, D., Xi, B., Su, J., Huo, S., Wang, J., Gong, F., Li, M., Jia, X., Wei, D., 2014. Structure equation modelbased approach for determining lake nutrient standards in Yungui Plateau ecoregion and Eastern
 Plain ecoregion lakes, China. Environ. EARTH Sci. 72, 3067–3077. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665014-3212-y
- 1164 Jones, I.D., Elliott, J.A., 2007. Modelling the effects of changing retention time on abundance and composi-1165 tion of phytoplankton species in а small lake. Freshw. Biol. 52, 988-997. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2427.2007.01746.x 1166
- Jones, J.R., Bachmann, R.W., 1976. Prediction of Phosphorus and Chlorophyll Levels in Lakes. J. Water
 Pollut. Control Fed. 48, 2176–2182.
- Jørgensen, S.E., 2015. Structurally dynamic models: a new promising model type. Environ. Earth Sci. 74,
 7041–7048. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-015-4735-6
- Jørgensen, S.E., 2010. A review of recent developments in lake modelling. Ecol. Model. 221, 689–692.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2009.10.022
- 1173 Jørgensen, S.E., 1990. Ecosystem theory, ecological buffer capacity, uncertainty and complexity. Ecol. Mod-

el. 52, 125–133. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(90)90013-7

- 1175 Jørgensen, S.E., Fath, B.D., 2001. Fundamentals of ecological modelling. Elsevier.
- Jung, N.-C., Popescu, I., Kelderman, P., Solomatine, D.P., Price, R.K., 2010. Application of model trees and
 other machine learning techniques for algal growth prediction in Yongdam reservoir, Republic of
 Korea. J. Hydroinformatics 12, 262–274. https://doi.org/10.2166/hydro.2009.004
- 1179 Kerimoglu, O., Hofmeister, R., Maerz, J., Riethmüller, R., Wirtz, K.W., 2017. The acclimative biogeochem1180 ical model of the southern North Sea. Biogeosciences 14, 4499–4531. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-141181 4499-2017
- Kim, D.K., Jeong, K.S., McKay, R.I.B., Chon, T.S., Joo, G.J., 2012. Machine Learning for Predictive Management: Short and Long term Prediction of Phytoplankton Biomass using Genetic Algorithm Based
 Recurrent Neural Networks. Int. J. Environ. Res. 6, 95–108. https://doi.org/10.22059/ijer.2011.476

- 1185 Kromkamp, J., Walsby, A.E., 1990. A computer model of buoyancy and vertical migration in cyanobacteria.
- 1186 J. Plankton Res. 12, 161–183. https://doi.org/10.1093/plankt/12.1.161
- Kuo, J., Thomann, R., 1983. Phytoplankton modeling in the embayments of lakes. J. Environ. Eng.-Asce
 109, 1311–1332.
- Kutas, T., Toth, J., 1985. A stochastic-model of phytoplankton dynamics in Lake Balaton. J. Stat. Comput.
 Simul. 21, 241–264. https://doi.org/10.1080/00949658508810818
- 1191 Le Moal, M., Gascuel-Odoux, C., Ménesguen, A., Souchon, Y., Étrillard, C., Levain, A., Moatar, F., Pan-
- 1192 nard, A., Souchu, P., Lefebvre, A., Pinay, G., 2018. Eutrophication: A new wine in an old bottle?
 1193 Sci. Total Environ. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.09.139
- 1194 Leon, L.F., Smith, R.E.H., Hipsey, M.R., Bocaniov, S.A., Higgins, S.N., Hecky, R.E., Antenucci, J.P.,
- 1195 Imberger, J.A., Guildford, S.J., 2011. Application of a 3D hydrodynamic-biological model for sea-
- sonal and spatial dynamics of water quality and phytoplankton in Lake Erie. J. Gt. Lakes Res. 37,
 41–53. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jglr.2010.12.007
- 1198 Leon, L.F., Smith, R.E.H., Malkin, S.Y., Depew, D., Hipsey, M.R., Antenucci, J.P., Higgins, S.N., Hecky,
- 1199 R.E., Rao, R.Y., 2012. Nested 3D modeling of the spatial dynamics of nutrients and phytoplankton
- 1200 in a Lake Ontario nearshore zone. J. Gt. Lakes Res. 38, 171–183. 1201 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jglr.2012.02.006
- Lewis, D.M., Elliott, J.A., Lambert, M.F., Reynolds, C.S., 2002. The simulation of an Australian reservoir
 using a phytoplankton community model: protech. Ecol. Model. 150, 107–116.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(01)00466-5
- Li, W., Qin, B., Zhu, G., 2014. Forecasting short-term cyanobacterial blooms in Lake Taihu, China, using a
 coupled hydrodynamic–algal biomass model. Ecohydrology 7, 794–802.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/eco.1402
- Li, Y., Gal, G., Makler-Pick, V., Waite, A.M., Bruce, L.C., Hipsey, M.R., 2014. Examination of the role of
 the microbial loop in regulating lake nutrient stoichiometry and phytoplankton dynamics.
 Biogeosciences 11, 2939–2960. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-11-2939-2014

- Li, Y., Liu, Y., Zhao, L., Hastings, A., Guo, H., 2015. Exploring change of internal nutrients cycling in a
 shallow lake: A dynamic nutrient driven phytoplankton model. Ecol. Model. 313, 137–148.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2015.06.025
- Lindim, C., Becker, A., Grueneberg, B., Fischer, H., 2015. Modelling the effects of nutrient loads reduction
 and testing the N and P control paradigm in a German shallow lake. Ecol. Eng. 82, 415–427.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2015.05.009
- Liu, B., 2013. Global dynamic behaviors for a delayed Nicholson's blowflies model with a linear harvesting
 term. Electron. J. Qual. THEORY Differ. Equ. 1–13.
- Liu, W.C., Chen, H.H., Hsieh, W.H., Chang, C.H., 2006. Linking watershed and eutrophication modelling
 for the Shihmen Reservoir, Taiwan. Water Sci. Technol. 54, 39–46.
 https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2006.834
- Liu, Y., Wang, Y., Sheng, H., Dong, F., Zou, R., Zhao, L., Guo, H., Zhu, X., He, B., 2014. Quantitative
 evaluation of lake eutrophication responses under alternative water diversion scenarios: A water
 quality modeling based statistical analysis approach. Sci. Total Environ. 468, 219–227.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.08.054
- Los, F.H., Brinkman, J.J., 1988. Phytoplankton Modelling by Means of Optimizing: A 10-year Experience
 with BLOOM II. Verhandlungen Int. Ver. Limnol. 23, 790–795.
- Los, F.J., 1980. An Algal Bloom Model as a Tool to Simulate Management Measures, in: Hypertrophic Eco systems, Developments in Hydrobiology. Springer, Dordrecht, pp. 171–178.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-009-9203-0 19
- Lung, W.S., Canale, R.P., Freedman, P.L., 1976. Phosphorus models for eutrophic lakes. Water Res. 10,
 1101–1114. https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354(76)90043-9
- Makler-Pick, V., Gal, G., Hipsey, M.R., 2011. Coupling of an individual-based model with a complex aquatic ecosystem model to explore the impact of the upper trophic level on lower trophic levels, in: International Congress on Modelling and Simulation. Presented at the International Congress on Modelling and Simulation, Perth, Australia, p. 7.

- 1237 Markensten, H., Moore, K., Persson, I., 2010. Simulated lake phytoplankton composition shifts toward cya-1238 nobacteria dominance in а future warmer climate. Ecol. Appl. 20, 752–767. 1239 https://doi.org/10.1890/08-2109.1
- Ménesguen, A., Lacroix, G., 2018. Modelling the marine eutrophication: A review. Sci. Total Environ. 636,
 339–354. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.04.183
- Mieleitner, J., Reichert, P., 2008. Modelling functional groups of phytoplankton in three lakes of different
 trophic state. Ecol. Model. 211, 279–291. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2007.09.010
- Mieleitner, J., Reichert, P., 2006. Analysis of the transferability of a biogeochemical lake model to lakes of
 different trophic state. Ecol. Model. 194, 49–61. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2005.10.039
- 1246 Millie, D.F., Weckman, G.R., Pigg, R.J., Tester, P.A., Dyble, J., Litaker, R.W., Carrick, H.J., Fahnenstiel,
- G.L., 2006. Modeling phytoplankton abundance in Saginaw Bay, Lake Huron: Using artificial neural
 networks to discern functional influence of environmental variables and relevance to a great lakes
 observing system. J. Phycol. 42, 336–349. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1529-8817.2006.00209.x
- Milstead, W.B., Hollister, J.W., Moore, R.B., Walker, H.A., 2013. Estimating Summer Nutrient Concentrations in Northeastern Lakes from SPARROW Load Predictions and Modeled Lake Depth and Volume. Plos One 8, e81457. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0081457
- 1253 Mooij, W.M., Brederveld, R.J., de Klein, J.J.M., DeAngelis, D.L., Downing, A.S., Faber, M., Gerla, D.J.,
- 1254 Hipsey, M.R., 't Hoen, J., Janse, J.H., Janssen, A.B.G., Jeuken, M., Kooi, B.W., Lischke, B.,
- 1255 Petzoldt, T., Postma, L., Schep, S.A., Scholten, H., Teurlincx, S., Thiange, C., Trolle, D., van Dam,
- A.A., van Gerven, L.P.A., van Nes, E.H., Kuiper, J.J., 2014. Serving many at once: How a database
 approach can create unity in dynamical ecosystem modelling. Environ. Model. Softw. 61, 266–273.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2014.04.004
- Mooij, W.M., Trolle, D., Jeppesen, E., Arhonditsis, G., Belolipetsky, P.V., Chitamwebwa, D.B.R.,
 Degermendzhy, A.G., DeAngelis, D.L., De Senerpont Domis, L.N., Downing, A.S., Elliott, J.A.,
- 1261 Fragoso, C.R., Gaedke, U., Genova, S.N., Gulati, R.D., Håkanson, L., Hamilton, D.P., Hipsey, M.R.,
- 1262 't Hoen, J., Hülsmann, S., Los, F.H., Makler-Pick, V., Petzoldt, T., Prokopkin, I.G., Rinke, K.,
- 1263 Schep, S.A., Tominaga, K., Van Dam, A.A., Van Nes, E.H., Wells, S.A., Janse, J.H., 2010. Chal-

- lenges and opportunities for integrating lake ecosystem modelling approaches. Aquat. Ecol. 44, 633–
 667. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10452-010-9339-3
- Moore, B.C., Chen, P.-H., Funk, W.H., Yonge, D., 1996. A model for predicting lake sediment oxygen demand following hypolimnetic aeration. JAWRA J. Am. Water Resour. Assoc. 32, 723–731.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1752-1688.1996.tb03469.x
- Moss, B., 2012. Cogs in the endless machine: Lakes, climate change and nutrient cycles: A review. Sci. Total Environ., Climate Change and Macronutrient Cycling along the Atmospheric, Terrestrial, Fresh-
- 1271 water and Estuarine Continuum A Special Issue dedicated to Professor Colin Neal 434, 130–142.
 1272 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2011.07.069
- Muraoka, K., Fukushima, T., 1986. On the box model for prediction of water quality in eutrophic lakes.
 Ecol. Model. 31, 221–236. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(86)90065-7
- Na, E.H., Park, S.S., 2006. A hydrodynamic and water quality modeling study of spatial and temporal patterns of phytoplankton growth in a stratified lake with buoyant incoming flow. Ecol. Model. 199,
 298–314. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2006.05.008
- National Academy of Sciences, 1969. Eutrophication: causes, consequences, correctives. Proceedings of
 Madison Symposium, Wisconsin, 11-15 June. 1967.
- Newcombe, G., 2012. International Guidance Manual for the Management of Toxic Cyanobacteria. Water
 Intell. Online 11. https://doi.org/10.2166/9781780401355
- Nielsen, A., Trolle, D., Bjerring, R., Søndergaard, M., Olesen, J.E., Janse, J.H., Mooij, W.M., Jeppesen, E.,
 2014. Effects of climate and nutrient load on the water quality of shallow lakes assessed through ensemble runs by PCLake. Ecol. Appl. 24, 1926–1944.
- Nürnberg, G.K., LaZerte, B.D., 2004. Modeling the effect of development on internal phosphorus load in
 nutrient-poor lakes. Water Resour. Res. 40, W01105. https://doi.org/10.1029/2003WR002410
- Nyholm, N., 1978. A simulation model for phytoplankton growth and nutrient cycling in eutrophic, shallow
 lakes. Ecol. Model. 4, 279–310. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(78)90011-X

- 1289 Obenour, D.R., Gronewold, A.D., Stow, C.A., Scavia, D., 2014. Using a Bayesian hierarchical model to
- 1290 improve Lake Erie cyanobacteria bloom forecasts. Water Resour. Res. 50, 7847–7860.
 1291 https://doi.org/10.1002/2014WR015616
- Ogilvie, S., Mitchell, S., 1995. A model of mussel filtration in a shallow new-zealand lake, with reference to
 eutrophication control. Arch. Hydrobiol. 133, 471–482.
- Onderka, M., 2007. Correlations between several environmental factors affecting the bloom events of cyano bacteria in Liptovska Mara reservoir (Slovakia)—A simple regression model. Ecol. Model. 209,
 412–416. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2007.07.028
- O'Neil, J.M., Davis, T.W., Burford, M.A., Gobler, C.J., 2012. The rise of harmful cyanobacteria blooms:
 The potential roles of eutrophication and climate change. Harmful Algae 14, 313–334.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hal.2011.10.027
- Ozkundakci, D., Hamilton, D.P., Trolle, D., 2011. Modelling the response of a highly eutrophic lake to reductions in external and internal nutrient loading. N. Z. J. Mar. Freshw. Res. 45, 165–185.
 https://doi.org/10.1080/00288330.2010.548072
- 1303 Paerl, H.W., Huisman, J., 2008. Blooms Like It Hot. Science 320, 57–58.
 1304 https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1156721
- Paerl, H.W., Paul, V.J., 2012. Climate change: Links to global expansion of harmful cyanobacteria. Water
 Res. 46, 1349–1363. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2011.08.002
- Paraska, D.W., Hipsey, M.R., Salmon, S.U., 2014. Sediment diagenesis models: Review of approaches, challenges and opportunities. Environ. Model. Softw. 61, 297–325.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2014.05.011
- Patterson, J., Hamilton, D., Ferris, J., 1994. Modelling of cyanobacterial blooms in the mixed layer of lakes
 and reservoirs. Mar. Freshw. Res. 45, 829. https://doi.org/10.1071/MF9940829
- Patynen, A., Elliott, J.A., Kiuru, P., Sarvala, J., Ventela, A.M., Jones, R.I., 2014. Modelling the impact of
 higher temperature on the phytoplankton of a boreal lake. Boreal Environ. Res. 19, 66–78.
- Peretyatko, A., Teissier, S., Backer, S.D., Triest, L., 2012. Classification trees as a tool for predicting
 cyanobacterial blooms. Hydrobiologia 689, 131–146. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-011-0803-4

- 1316 Perga, M.-E., Maberly, S.C., Jenny, J.-P., Alric, B., Pignol, C., Naffrechoux, E., 2016. A century of human-
- driven changes in the carbon dioxide concentration of lakes. Glob. Biogeochem. Cycles 30, 93–104.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/2015GB005286
- Perroud, M., Goyette, S., Martynov, A., Beniston, M., Annevillec, O., 2009. Simulation of multiannual
 thermal profiles in deep Lake Geneva: A comparison of one-dimensional lake models. Limnol.
 Oceanogr. 54, 1574–1594.
- Pers, B., 2005. Modeling the response of eutrophication control measures in a Swedish lake. AMBIO 34,
 552–558. https://doi.org/10.1639/0044-7447(2005)034[0552:MTROEC]2.0.CO;2
- Pinay, G., Gascuel, C., Menesguen, A., Souchon, Y., Le Moal, M., 2017. L'eutrophisation : manifestations,
 causes, conséquences et prédictibilité . Synthèse de l'Expertise scientifique collective. CNRS Ifremer INRA Irstea, France.
- Pipp, E., Rott, E., 1995. A phytoplankton compartment model for a small meromictic lake with special reference to species-specific niches and long-term changes. Ecol. Model. 78, 129–148.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(94)00123-Y
- 1330 Politi, E., Prairie, Y.T., 2018. The potential of Earth Observation in modelling nutrient loading and water 1331 quality in lakes of southern Quebec, Canada. Aquat. Sci. 80, UNSP 8. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00027-017-0559-7 1332
- Pomati, F., Matthews, B., Seehausen, O., Ibelings, B.W., 2017. Eutrophication and climate warming alter
 spatial (depth) co-occurrence patterns of lake phytoplankton assemblages. Hydrobiologia 787, 375–
 385. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-016-2981-6
- Posch, T., Köster, O., Salcher, M.M., Pernthaler, J., 2012. Harmful filamentous cyanobacteria favoured by 1336 warming. 1337 reduced water turnover with lake Nat. Clim. Change 2. 809-813. 1338 https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1581
- Rankovic, V., Radulovic, J., Radojevic, I., Ostojic, A., Comic, L., 2010. Neural network modeling of dissolved oxygen in the Gruza reservoir, Serbia. Ecol. Model. 221, 1239–1244.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2009.12.023

- 1342 Reckhow, K., 1993. A random coefficient model for chlorophyll nutrient relationships in lakes. Ecol. Model.
- 1343 70, 35–50. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(93)90071-Y
- Reckhow, K.H., 1994. Water quality simulation modeling and uncertainty analysis for risk assessment and
 decision making. Ecol. Model. 72, 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(94)90143-0
- 1346 Recknagel, F., Adrian, R., Koehler, J., Cao, H., 2016. Threshold quantification and short-term forecasting of
- 1347 Anabaena, Aphanizomenon and Microcystis in the polymictic eutrophic Lake Muggelsee (Germany)
- by inferential modelling using the hybrid evolutionary algorithm HEA. Hydrobiologia 778, 61–74.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-015-2442-7
- Reynolds, C.S., Irish, A.E., 1997. Modelling phytoplankton dynamics in lakes and reservoirs: the problem of
 in-situ growth rates. Hydrobiologia 349, 5–17. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1003020823129
- 1352 Reynolds, C. S., Irish, A.E., Elliott, J.A., 2001. The ecological basis for simulating phytoplankton responses
 1353 to environmental change (PROTECH). Ecol. Model. 140, 271–291.
- Reynolds, C.S., Irish, A.E., Elliott, J.A., 2001. The ecological basis for simulating phytoplankton responses
 to environmental change (PROTECH). Ecol. Model. 140, 271–291. https://doi.org/10.1016/S03043800(01)00330-1
- Rigosi, A., Fleenor, W., Rueda, F., 2010. State-of-the-art and recent progress in phytoplankton succession
 modelling. Environ. Rev. 18, 423–440. https://doi.org/10.1139/A10-021
- Riley, M.J., Stefan, H.G., 1988. Minlake: A dynamic lake water quality simulation model. Ecol. Model. 43,
 1360 155–182. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(88)90002-6
- Rivera, E.C., de Queiroz, J.F., Ferraz, J.M., Ortega, E., 2007. Systems models to evaluate eutrophication in
 the Broa Reservoir, Sao Carlos, Brazil. Ecol. Model. 202, 518–526.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2006.11.016
- Riverson, J., Coats, R., Costa-Cabral, M., Dettinger, M., Reuter, J., Sahoo, G., Schladow, G., 2013. Modeling the transport of nutrients and sediment loads into Lake Tahoe under projected climatic changes.
 Clim. Change 116, 35–50. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-012-0629-8

- Robertson, D.M., Saad, D.A., 2011. Nutrient Inputs to the Laurentian Great Lakes by Source and Watershed
 Estimated Using SPARROW Watershed Models1. JAWRA J. Am. Water Resour. Assoc. 47, 1011–
 1033. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1752-1688.2011.00574.x
- 1370 Rodriguez Reartes, S.B., Estrada, V., Bazan, R., Larrosa, N., Cossavella, A., Lopez, A., Busso, F., Diaz,
- M.S., 2016. Evaluation of ecological effects of anthropogenic nutrient loading scenarios in Los
 Molinos reservoir through a mathematical model. Ecol. Model. 320, 393–406.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2015.10.028
- Romshoo, S.A., Muslim, M., 2011. Geospatial modeling for assessing the nutrient load of a Himalayan lake.
 Environ. EARTH Sci. 64, 1269–1282. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-011-0944-9
- Rukhovets, L., Astrakhantsev, G., Menshutkin, V., Minina, T., Petrova, N., Poloskov, V., 2003. Development of Lake Ladoga ecosystem models: modeling of the phytoplankton succession in the eutrophication process. I. Ecol. Model. 165, 49–77. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(03)00061-9
- 1379 Sagehashi, M., Sakoda, A., Suzuki, M., 2001. A mathematical model of a shallow and eutrophic lake (the
 1380 Keszthely Basin, Lake Balaton) and simulation of restorative manipulations. WATER Res. 35,
 1381 1675–1686. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0043-1354(00)00435-8
- Sahoo, G.B., Luketina, D., 2003. Modeling of bubble plume design and oxygen transfer for reservoir restoration. Water Res. 37, 393–401. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0043-1354(02)00283-X
- 1384 Salerno, F., Viviano, G., Carraro, E., Manfredi, E.C., Lami, A., Musazzi, S., Marchetto, A., Guyennon, N.,
- Tartari, G., Copetti, D., 2014. Total phosphorus reference condition for subalpine lakes: A comparison among traditional methods and a new process-based watershed approach. J. Environ. Manage.
 145, 94–105. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2014.06.011
- Sarkar, R.R., Chattopadhayay, J., 2003. Occurrence of planktonic blooms under environmental fluctuations
 and its possible control mechanism—mathematical models and experimental observations. J. Theor.
 Biol. 224, 501–516. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-5193(03)00200-5
- Scavia, D., Powers, W.F., Canale, R.P., Moody, J.L., 1981. Comparison of first-order error analysis and
 Monte Carlo Simulation in time-dependent lake eutrophication models. Water Resour. Res. 17,
 1051–1059. https://doi.org/10.1029/WR017i004p01051

- Schindler, D.W., 2009. Lakes as sentinels and integrators for the effects of climate change on watersheds,
 airsheds, and landscapes. Limnol Ocean. 54, 2349–2358.
- Schindler, D.W., 2006. Recent advances in the understanding and management of eutrophication. Limnol.
 Oceanogr. 51, 356–363.
- 1398 Schnoor, J., O'Connor, D., 1980. A steady-state eutrophication model for lakes. Water Res. 14, 1651–1665.
 1399 https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354(80)90071-8
- Schwalb, A.N., Bouffard, D., Boegman, L., Leon, L., Winter, J.G., Molot, L.A., Smith, R.E.H., 2015. 3D
 modelling of dreissenid mussel impacts on phytoplankton in a large lake supports the nearshore
 shunt hypothesis and the importance of wind-driven hydrodynamics. Aquat. Sci. 77, 95–114.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00027-014-0369-0
- Schwefel, R., Gaudard, A., Wuest, A., Bouffard, D., 2016. Effects of climate change on deepwater oxygen
 and winter mixing in a deep lake (Lake Geneva): Comparing observational findings and modeling.
 WATER Resour. Res. 52, 8794–8809. https://doi.org/10.1002/2016WR019194
- Seip, K.L., 1991. The ecosystem of a mesotrophic lake-I. Simulating plankton biomass and the timing of
 phytoplankton blooms. Aquat. Sci. 53, 239–262. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00877061
- Seo, D.-I., Canale, R.P., 1996. Performance, reliability and uncertainty of total phosphorus models for
 lakes—I. Deterministic analyses. Water Res. 30, 83–94. https://doi.org/10.1016/00431354(95)00114-Z
- Shan, K., Li, L., Wang, X., Wu, Y., Hu, L., Yu, G., Song, L., 2014. Modelling ecosystem structure and
 trophic interactions in a typical cyanobacterial bloom-dominated shallow Lake Dianchi, China. Ecol.
 Model. 291, 82–95. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2014.07.015
- Shimoda, Y., Arhonditsis, G.B., 2016. Phytoplankton functional type modelling: Running before we can
 walk? A critical evaluation of the current state of knowledge. Ecol. Model. 320, 29–43.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2015.08.029
- 1418 Silva, T.F. das G., Vinçon-Leite, B., Giani, A., Figueredo, C.C., Petrucci, G., Lemaire, B., Sperling, E.V.,
- 1419 Tassin, B., Seidl, M., Tran Khac, V., Viana, P.S., Viana, V.F.L., Toscano, R.A., Rodrigues, B.H.M.,
- 1420 Nascimento, N. de O., 2016. Modelagem da Lagoa da Pampulha: uma ferramenta para avaliar o

- 1421 impacto da bacia hidrográfica na dinâmica do fitoplâncton. Eng. Sanit. E Ambient. 21, 95–108.
 1422 https://doi.org/10.1590/S1413-41520201600100125692
- 1423 Simonsen, J.F., Dahl-Madsen, K.I., 1978. Eutrophication Models for Lakes. Nord. Hydrol. 9, 12.
- Singleton, V.L., Rueda, F.J., Little, J.C., 2010. A coupled bubble plume–reservoir model for hypolimnetic
 oxygenation. Water Resour. Res. 46. https://doi.org/10.1029/2009WR009012
- Smith, S.L., Merico, A., Wirtz, K.W., Pahlow, M., 2014. Leaving misleading legacies behind in plankton
 ecosystem modelling. J. Plankton Res. 36, 613–620. https://doi.org/10.1093/plankt/fbu011
- Smith, V.H., Joye, S.B., Howarth, R.W., 2006. Eutrophication of freshwater and marine ecosystems. Limnol
 Ocean. 51, 351–355.
- 1430 Smits, J.G.C., van der Molen, D.T., 1993. Application of SWITCH, a model for sediment-water exchange of
- 1431 nutrients, to Lake Veluwe in The Netherlands. HYDROBIOLOGIA 253, 20.
 1432 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00050749
- Snodgrass, W.J., 1987. Analysis of Models and Measurements for Sediment Oxygen Demand in Lake Erie.
 J. Gt. Lakes Res. 13, 738–756. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0380-1330(87)71688-8
- Snodgrass, W.J., 1985. Lake Ontario oxygen model. 2. Errors associated with estimating transport across the
 thermocline. Environ. Sci. Technol. 19, 180–185. https://doi.org/10.1021/es00132a012
- Sondergaard, M., Jeppesen, E., 2007. Anthropogenic impacts on lake and stream ecosystems, and approaches
 to restoration. J. Appl. Ecol. 44, 1089–1094.
- 1439 Soulignac, F., Vinçon-Leite, B., Lemaire, B.J., Scarati Martins, J.R., Bonhomme, C., Dubois, P., Mezemate,
- 1440 Y., Tchiguirinskaia, I., Schertzer, D., Tassin, B., 2017. Performance Assessment of a 3D Hydrody-
- 1441 namic Model Using High Temporal Resolution Measurements in a Shallow Urban Lake. Environ.
- 1442 Model. Assess. 22, 309–322. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10666-017-9548-4
- Stansbury, J., Kozimor, L., Admiraal, D., Dove, E., 2008. Water quality modeling of the effects of
 macrophytes on dissolved oxygen in a shallow tailwater reservoir. Lake Reserv. Manag. 24, 339–
 348. https://doi.org/10.1080/07438140809354844

- 1446 Stepanenko, V., Mammarella, I., Ojala, A., Miettinen, H., Lykosov, V., Vesala, T., 2016. LAKE 2.0: a model
- 1447 for temperature, methane, carbon dioxide and oxygen dynamics in lakes. Geosci. Model Dev. 9, 1448 1977–2006. https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-9-1977-2016
- Stepanenko, V.M., Goyette, S., Martynov, A., Perroud, M., Fang, X., Mironov, D., 2010. First steps of a
 Lake Model Intercomparison Project: LakeMIP. Boreal Environ. Res. 15, 191–202.
- 1451 Stepanenko, V.M., Martynov, A., Jöhnk, K.D., Subin, Z.M., Perroud, M., Fang, X., Beyrich, F., Mironov,
- 1452D., Goyette, S., 2012. A one-dimensional model intercomparison study of thermal regime of a shal-1453low, turbid midlatitude lake. Geosci. Model Dev. 6, 1337–1352. https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-6-
- 1454 1337-2013
- Stow, C., Carpenter, S., Lathrop, R., 1997. A Bayesian observation error model to predict cyanobacterial
 biovolume from spring total phosphorus in Lake Mendota, Wisconsin. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 54,
 464–473. https://doi.org/10.1139/cjfas-54-2-464
- Takkouk, S., Casamitjana, X., 2016. Application of the DYRESM–CAEDYM model to the Sau Reservoir
 situated in Catalonia, Spain. Desalination Water Treat. 57, 12453–12466.
 https://doi.org/10.1080/19443994.2015.1053530
- Takolander, A., Cabeza, M., Leskinen, E., 2017. Climate change can cause complex responses in Baltic Sea
 macroalgae: A systematic review. J. Sea Res. 123, 16–29.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2017.03.007
- Terry, J.A., Sadeghian, A., Lindenschmidt, K.-E., 2017. Modelling Dissolved Oxygen/Sediment Oxygen
 Demand under Ice in a Shallow Eutrophic Prairie Reservoir. Water 9, 131.
 https://doi.org/10.3390/w9020131
- Teruggi, S., Vendegna, V., 1986. Ecological models as support systems to decisions in lake management
 planning. Sci. Total Environ. 55, 261–273. https://doi.org/10.1016/0048-9697(86)90185-3
- Toffolon, M., Serafini, M., 2013. Effects of artificial hypolimnetic oxygenation in a shallow lake. Part 2:
 Numerical modelling. J. Environ. Manag. Artic. 114, 530–539.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2012.10.063

- 1472 Trolle, D., Elliott, J.A., Mooij, W.M., Janse, J.H., Bolding, K., Hamilton, D.P., Jeppesen, E., 2014. Advanc-
- 1473 ing projections of phytoplankton responses to climate change through ensemble modelling. Environ.
 1474 Model. Softw. 61, 371–379. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2014.01.032
- 1475 Trolle, D., Hamilton, D.P., Hipsey, M.R., Bolding, K., Bruggeman, J., Mooij, W.M., Janse, J.H., Nielsen, A.,
- 1476 Jeppesen, E., Elliott, J.A., Makler-Pick, V., Petzoldt, T., Rinke, K., Flindt, M.R., Arhonditsis, G.B.,
- Gal, G., Bjerring, R., Tominaga, K., Hoen, J., Downing, A.S., Marques, D.M., Jr, C.R.F.,
 Søndergaard, M., Hanson, P.C., 2011a. A community-based framework for aquatic ecosystem mod-
- 1479 els. Hydrobiologia 683, 25–34. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-011-0957-0
- Trolle, D., Hamilton, D.P., Pilditch, C.A., Duggan, I.C., Jeppesen, E., 2011b. Predicting the effects of climate change on trophic status of three morphologically varying lakes: Implications for lake restoration and management. Environ. Model. Softw. 26, 354–370.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2010.08.009
- Trolle, D., Skovgaard, H., Jeppesen, E., 2008. The Water Framework Directive: Setting the phosphorus loading target for a deep lake in Denmark using the 1D lake ecosystem model DYRESM–CAEDYM.
 Ecol. Model. 219, 138–152. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2008.08.005
- Tyler, A.N., Svab, E., Preston, T., Presing, M., Kovacs, W.A., 2006. Remote sensing of the water quality of
 shallow lakes: A mixture modelling approach to quantifying phytoplankton in water characterized by
 high-suspended sediment. Int. J. Remote Sens. 27, 1521–1537.
 https://doi.org/10.1080/01431160500419311
- van Puijenbroek, P., Janse, J.H., Knoop, J.M., 2004. Integrated modelling for nutrient loading and ecology of
 lakes in The Netherlands. Ecol. Model. 174, 127–141.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2004.01.002
- Van Straten, G.T., Keesman, K.J., 1991. Uncertainty propagation and speculation in projective forecasts of
 environmental change: A lake-eutrophication example. J. Forecast. 10, 163–190.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/for.3980100110

- 1497 Vanhuet, H., 1992. Phosphorus eutrophication in the SW Frisian lake district .1. Monitoring and assessment
- 1498 of a dynamic mass balance model. Hydrobiologia 233, 259–270.
 1499 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00016114
- 1500 Varis, O., 1993. Cyanobacteria dynamics in a restored finnish lake a long-term simulation study.
 1501 Hydrobiologia 268, 129–145. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00014049
- Verhagen, J., 1994. Modeling phytoplankton patchiness under the influence of wind-driven currents in lakes.
 Limnol. Oceanogr. 39, 1551–1565. https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.1994.39.7.1551
- Vollenweider, R.A., 1975. Input-output models. With special reference to the phosphorus loading concept in
 limnology. Schweiz. Z. Für Hydrol. 37, 53–84. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02505178
- 1506 Vollenweider, R.A., Kerekes, J., 1982. Eutrophication of waters. Monitoring, assessment and control. OECD
 1507 Cooperative programme on monitoring of inland waters. OECD, Paris.
- Wagner, C., Adrian, R., 2009. Cyanobacteria dominance: Quantifying the effects of climate change. Limnol.
 Oceanogr. 54, 2460–2468. https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2009.54.6_part_2.2460
- 1510 Walker, R.R., Snodgrass, W.J., 1986. Model for Sediment Oxygen Demand in Lakes. J. Environ. Eng. 112,
 1511 25–43. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)0733-9372(1986)112:1(25)
- Walsby, A., 2005. Stratification by cyanobacteria in lakes: a dynamic buoyancy model indicates size limitations met by Planktothrix rubescens filaments. NEW Phytol. 168, 365–376.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2005.01508.x
- Wang, B., Qi, Q., 2018. Modeling the lake eutrophication stochastic ecosystem and the research of its stability. Math. Biosci. 300, 102–114. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mbs.2018.03.019
- 1517 Wetzel, R.G., 2001. Limnology: Lake and River Ecosystems. Academic Press.
- World Commission on Dams, 2000. Dams and development : a new framework for decision-making. The
 report of the World Commission on Dams.
- Wu, Z., Liu, Y., Liang, Z., Wu, S., Guo, H., 2017. Internal cycling, not external loading, decides the nutrient
 limitation in eutrophic lake: A dynamic model with temporal Bayesian hierarchical inference. WA-
- 1522 TER Res. 116, 231–240. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2017.03.039

1523 Xenopoulos, M.A., Downing, J.A., Kumar, M.D., Menden-Deuer, S., Voss, M., 2017. Headwaters to oceans:
 1524 Ecological and biogeochemical contrasts across the aquatic continuum. Limnol. Oceanogr. 62, S3–

1525 S14. https://doi.org/10.1002/lno.10721

- Xu, F.-L., Jorgensen, S.E., Kong, X.-Z., He, W., Qin, N., 2014. Development of Ecological Models for the
 Effects of Macrophyte Restoration on the Ecosystem Health of a Large Eutrophic Chinese Lake
 (Lake Chaohu), in: Jorgensen, SE and Chang, NB and Xu, FL (Ed.), Ecological Modelling and Engineering of Lakes and Wetlands, Developments in Environmental Modelling. ELSEVIER, pp. 337–
 373. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-444-63249-4.00014-2
- 1531 Xu, F.-L., Jørgensen, S.E., Tao, S., Li, B.-G., 1999. Modeling the effects of ecological engineering on eco1532 system health of a shallow eutrophic Chinese lake (Lake Chao). Ecol. Model. 117, 239–260.
 1533 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(99)00005-8
- Xu, Yunfeng, Ma, C., Liu, Q., Xi, B., Qian, G., Zhang, D., Huo, S., 2015. Method to predict key factors affecting lake eutrophication A new approach based on Support Vector Regression model. Int.
 Biodeterior. Biodegrad. 102, 308–315. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ibiod.2015.02.013
- 1537 Xu, Y., Schroth, A.W., Isles, P.D.F., Rizzo, D.M., 2015. Quantile regression improves models of lake eu1538 trophication with implications for ecosystem-specific management. Freshw. Biol. 60, 1841–1853.
 1539 https://doi.org/10.1111/fwb.12615
- 1540 Xu, Z., Xu, Y.J., 2016. A Deterministic Model for Predicting Hourly Dissolved Oxygen Change: Develop1541 ment and Application to a Shallow Eutrophic Lake. WATER 8. https://doi.org/10.3390/w8020041
- Yacobi, Y.Z., 2006. Temporal and vertical variation of chlorophyll alpha concentration, phytoplankton photosynthetic activity and light attenuation in Lake Kinneret: possibilities and limitations for simulation by remote sensing. J. Plankton Res. 28, 725–736. https://doi.org/10.1093/plamktfbl004
- Yao, X., Zhang, Y., Zhang, L., Zhou, Y., 2018. A bibliometric review of nitrogen research in eutrophic lakes
 and reservoirs. J. Environ. Sci. 66, 274–285. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jes.2016.10.022
- Yi, X., Zou, R., Guo, H., 2016. Global sensitivity analysis of a three-dimensional nutrients-algae dynamic
 model for a large shallow lake. Ecol. Model. 327, 74–84.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2016.01.005

- 1550 Zhang, H., Culver, D.A., Boegman, L., 2008. A two-dimensional ecological model of Lake Erie: Application
- to estimate dreissenid impacts on large lake plankton populations. Ecol. Model. 214, 219–241.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2008.02.005
- Zhang, H., Hu, W., Gu, K., Li, Q., Zheng, D., Zhai, S., 2013. An improved ecological model and software
 for short-term algal bloom forecasting. Environ. Model. Softw. 48, 152–162.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2013.07.001
- Zhang, X., Recknagel, F., Chen, Q., Cao, H., Li, R., 2015. Spatially-explicit modelling and forecasting of
 cyanobacteria growth in Lake Taihu by evolutionary computation. Ecol. Model. 306, 216–225.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2014.05.013

Continent	Number of	Country	Number of	Lake name	Area	Number of
Continent	publications	Country	publications	Lake hame	(km ²)	publications
North America	94	USA-Canada	62	Great lakes	244 000	47
Asia	75	China	51	Lake Erie	25 700	27
Western Europe	20	USA	39	Lake Taihu	2 250	26
Northern Europe	19	Netherlands	10	Lake Ontario	19 000	13
Eastern Europe	7	Japan	8	Lake Michigan	58 000	11
Southern Europe	6	Finland	7	Lake Superior	82 000	9
Oceania	6	Canada	7	Lake Dianchi	298	9
Southern Europe	5	Israel	6	Lake Washington	88	8
Africa	5	United Kingdom	5	Lake Huron	60 000	6
		Hungary	5	Lake Kinneret	166	6
		New-Zealand	4	Lake Balaton	592	5
		Estonia-Russia	3	Lake Veluwe	30	5
		Greece	3	Lake Chaohu	760	5
		Switzerland	3	Lake Okeechobee	1891	4
		Germany	3	Lake Peipsi	3 555	3
		Turkey	3	Lake Bassenthwaite	5	3
		Russia	3	Lake Columbia	3	3
				Lake Spokane	19	3
				Lake Kasumigaura	220	3

 Table 1. Number of publications depending on the continent, the country and the name of the studied lake. Only the

 countries and the lakes that have been found in three or more than three publications are listed.

General Categories	records	% of 438		
Science technology	435	99.3		
Life sciences biomedicine	363	82.9		
Physical sciences	154	35.2		
Technology	99	22.6		
Social sciences	2	0.5		
Research Areas	records	% of 438		
Environmental Sciences and Ecology	272	62.1		
Marine and Freshwater biology	141	32.2		
Water resources	101	23.1		
Engineering	86	19.6		
Geology	30	6.8		
Oceanography	22	5.0		
Mathematics	10	2.3		
Computer science	9	2.1		
Journal Titles	records	% of 438		
Ecological modelling	70	16.0		
Hydrobiologia	25	5.7		
Journal of great lakes research	25	5.7		
Water research	18	4.1		
Water science and technology	13	3.0		
Limnology and oceanography	12	2.7		
Water resources research	11	2,5		
Lake reservoir management	11	2,5		
Ecological engineering	8	1.8		
Freshwater biology	7	1.6		
Science of the Total Environment	7	1.6		

Table 2. Repartition of the publications according to their general categories, their research areas and the journal title (provided by Web of Science). Only the research areas (respectively the journal titles) that represent more than 2% (respectively 1.5%) of the bibliographic corpus are listed.

Study sites		Objectives		What is represented in the model		Study of the impact of	
Study Sites		Objectives					
226	lake	54	management	117	phosphorus	33	load
213	water	49	simulation	115	phytoplankton	32	environment
147	eutrophic	31	prediction	74	nutrient	31	climate
55	reservoir	22	restoration	56	sediment	26	temperature
46	river			46	nitrogen	22	light
39	shallow	Methods		46	oxygen	on	
27	Erie	229	model	44	chlorophyll	97	water quality
25	fresh water	21	regression	35	cyanobacteria	64	dynamics
24	bay	21	sensitivity analysis	34	iron	47	ecosystem
21	great lakes		1	27	algae	37	growth
<u> </u>	I	1		23	zooplankton	29	blooms

Table 3. Classification of keywords according to the number of publications in which they appear.



Figure 1. Time evolution of the number of publications according to the continent of the studied lake.

Figure Click here to download Figure: Figure2.eps





Figure 3. . Number of publications and citations per year, based on the ISI Web of Science citation report.

Highlights

- Lake eutrophication models applied to study sites with management objectives
- Focus on process-based models and cyanobacteria dynamics
- Coupling of hydrodynamics and ecological processes
- Comparison of model results to field data
- Review based on a validated methodology of Scientific Collective Expertise

sensitivity analysis **lakes** phytoplankton de bloom de cyanobacteria **eutrophication** restoration scenarios management prediction **modelling reservoirs** process-based models **climate change**